United Nations E/2009/90

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
8 June 2009

Original: English

Substantive session of 2009
Geneva, 6-31 July 2009
Item 14 (g) of the provisional agenda*
Social and human rights questions: human rights

Report of the High Commissioner for Human Rights on implementation of economic, social and cultural rights

Summary

The present report presents the concepts of implementing and monitoring human rights with specific reference to economic, social and cultural rights. Section II addresses the specific challenges posed by the complex array of obligations that stem from economic, social and cultural rights, including progressive realization and non-discrimination. Section III outlines various ways of monitoring legislation and other normative measures, such as regulations, policies, plans and programmes, and elaborates on monitoring the realization of rights, paying particular attention to human rights impact assessments, the use of indicators and benchmarks and budget analysis. It also addresses the issue of monitoring violations of economic, social and cultural rights.

* E/2009/100

09-36290 (E) 240609

Please recycle

Contents

		Page
I.	Introduction	3
II.	General overview of implementation and monitoring of economic, social and cultural rights	3
	A. Concepts	3
	B. Types of obligation	4
	C. Implications of different types of obligation for implementation and monitoring of economic, social and cultural rights	7
III.	Monitoring approaches and methods	9
	A. Monitoring legislation and normative institutional frameworks	9
	B. Monitoring the realization of economic, social and cultural rights	10
	C. Monitoring violations of economic, social and cultural rights	15
IV.	Conclusions	18

I. Introduction

1. The present report, submitted pursuant to General Assembly resolution 48/141, focuses on the implementation and monitoring of economic, social and cultural rights. It complements three previous reports to the Economic and Social Council (E/2006/86, E/2007/82 and E/2008/76), which addressed, respectively, the issues of legal protection of economic, social and cultural rights, the concept of "progressive realization", and the application of the principle of equality between men and women and the prohibition of discrimination against women in respect of their economic, social and cultural rights.

II. General overview of implementation and monitoring of economic, social and cultural rights

A. Concepts

2. The concepts of implementation and monitoring are deeply entrenched in the core international human rights instruments covering economic, social and cultural rights. According to article 2, paragraph 1, of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, each State party is required:

> "to take steps, individually and through international assistance and cooperation, especially economic and technical, to the maximum of its available resources, with a view to achieving progressively the full realization of the rights recognized in the present Covenant by all appropriate means, including particularly the adoption of legislative measures".

3. Implementation is the act of putting into effect a decision, or providing practical means to accomplish something. In the context of international human rights law, this means moving from a legal commitment, that is, acceptance of an international human rights obligation, to realization by the adoption of appropriate measures and ultimately the enjoyment by all of the rights enshrined under the related obligations.

4. As for monitoring, assessing compliance with any human rights obligation requires gathering and evaluating information. The spirit of the periodic State party reporting system under every core international human rights treaty clearly reflects this need: it requires State parties to produce reports about "the measures which they have adopted and the progress made in achieving the observance"[1] of the rights at stake, and it entrusts treaty bodies with considering those reports in order to evaluate performance by States.

5. Monitoring has two important defining features. Firstly, it is a continuous activity that systematically uses information in order to measure the achievement of

[1] Article 16 of International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The wording is substantively similar to equivalent provisions in other international human rights instruments, for example, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, article 9; the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, article 40; Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, article 18; the Convention on the Rights of the Child, article 44; the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities article 35, paragraph 1.

defined targets and objectives within a specified time frame. Secondly, it provides feedback on the implementation process and on implementation problems.[2] In the context of the present report, targets and objectives are those set by international human rights obligations; monitoring is thus understood as a systematic gathering of information with a view to evaluating compliance with human rights commitments.

6. The present report will address some specific monitoring needs and challenges, stemming from the nature of the obligations created by economic, social and cultural rights. International law itself underlines the importance of monitoring in the field of human rights as it establishes under all core international human rights treaties bodies of experts tasked to monitor the implementation of the obligations embodied in each treaty. Furthermore, soft law instruments, including "general comments",[3] have explicitly underscored the importance of monitoring in the field of economic, social and cultural rights.[4] Some general comments even consider that the obligation to monitor progress towards the full realization of a right is part of the minimum core content of that right.[5]

7. Monitoring can have different purposes and can be carried out by different actors. Accordingly, the scope and methods of monitoring vary, depending on what is the intended purpose and on who is conducting it. The present report primarily addresses monitoring by various State party actors, including different State branches and agencies, such as ministries, national human rights institutions and the judiciary, for different purposes. The monitoring techniques and methods suggested in the report may also be relevant for civil society organizations, treaty bodies and other stakeholders.

8. Implementation and monitoring are deeply intertwined. Implementation involves both process and outcome: measures adopted and results achieved. Monitoring is needed to assess whether measures are adopted and applied and whether they are appropriate, but also to evaluate their results. Monitoring provides feedback for implementation: the evaluation of measures adopted and results achieved constitutes valuable information either to confirm the direction of some specific steps, or to correct them when necessary.

B. Types of obligation

9. Economic, social and cultural rights are recognized in several international human rights instruments. In addition to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, such rights are also recognized in other core treaties, including the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against

---

[2] See J. Valadez and M. Bamberger (eds.), *Monitoring and Evaluating Social Programs in Developing Countries: a Handbook for Policymakers, Managers, and Researchers*, EDI Development Studies (Washington, D.C., The World Bank, 1994).

[3] For a compilation of the general comments adopted by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, see document HRI/GEN/1/Rev. 9 (Vol. 1).

[4] See, for example, *Voluntary Guidelines to Support the Progressive Realization of the Right to Adequate Food in the Context of National Food Security* (Council of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, November 2004), guideline 17 addresses "Monitoring, indicators and benchmarks". See also Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, general comment No. 4, para. 13, and general comment No. 12, para. 31, among others.

[5] See, for example, Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 14, para. 43 (f) and general comment No. 19, para. 59 (f).

Women, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.

Obligations to respect, protect and fulfil

10. Economic, social and cultural rights, like all human rights, entail both negative and positive obligations for the State party. In some cases, States must refrain from certain behaviour (a negative obligation), for example to avoid taking measures that would prevent access to food by right holders. In other cases, a State must take measures to provide for the realization of human rights (a positive obligation), such as measures to ensure access to universal, compulsory and free primary education.

11. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights makes a distinction between obligations to respect, protect and fulfil. Obligations to respect require States to refrain from unduly interfering with the enjoyment of a right. For example, they should not create obstacles to the formation of trade unions or impede the use of their language by minorities. Obligations to protect require States to prevent, deter, stop or impose sanctions on third parties when they are unduly interfering in the enjoyment of a right. For example, States should regulate the activities of employers and private providers of water and sanitation services. Obligations to fulfil require States to facilitate, provide or promote the enjoyment of a right when the right holders, for reasons that are beyond their willingness or capacity, cannot do so. For example, States should establish a social security system and implement food aid schemes or programmes when individuals or groups of individuals cannot secure food for reasons beyond their willingness or capacity. This tripartite typology underlines the multidimensional nature of human rights in general, and of economic, social and cultural rights in particular.

Obligations of "immediate effect" and of taking measures towards "progressive realization"

12. An important feature that makes monitoring essential for economic, social and cultural rights is the notion of progressive realization. Not all of the obligations regarding economic, social and cultural rights, however, are qualified by the notion of progressive realization. Some obligations, such as the obligation to take steps towards realization, the prohibition of discrimination and the satisfaction of minimum core obligations, are of immediate effect. All rights may also include immediately enforceable aspects. For example, the right to adequate housing entails an immediate obligation to protect from forced eviction.

13. Therefore, while not all aspects of economic, social and cultural rights are subject to progressive realization, the framers of the Covenant acknowledged that progress towards the full realization of rights would in many cases be gradual and dependent on available resources. Thus, in a world of innumerable needs and limited resources, States have a margin within which they may determine the use of their resources and prioritize some demands over others. It is conceivable that there may be situations where economic, social and cultural rights are not fully realized for all, and yet the State is not in breach of its international obligations. For example, the State could discharge its duties regarding the right to housing if it has complied with minimum core obligations, including the provision of shelter for homeless people

and protection against forced eviction, and it is devoting the maximum of its available resources to ensure reasonable housing solutions, even if not everyone is ensured long-term security of tenure.

14. The notion of progressive realization requires progress, that is, improvement over time. States need to undertake deliberate, concrete and targeted measures, making the most efficient use of available resources, to move as expeditiously and effectively as possible towards the full realization of the rights enshrined in the Covenant.[6] Monitoring progressive realization would therefore entail comparisons over time, to evaluate whether there was progress, stagnation or retrogression. One of the objectives of the periodic review of State reports by treaty bodies is to compare over time the evolution of the degree of normative recognition and effective enjoyment of the rights recognized in the respective instruments. The need for this comparison is even more explicit when an international human rights instrument has included a specific obligation of progressive realization.

15. The obligation to progressively realize economic, social and cultural rights also entails a related prohibition of deliberate retrogression. This means that it is prohibited to adopt measures aimed at reducing the level of protection that some rights have already gained. The restriction or limitation of rights that have already been provided for (such as access to free primary health-care services for children) or the abrogation of legislation necessary to exercise a right, are examples of deliberate retrogressive measures, which are considered by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights a prima facie violation of the Covenant unless the State can show that it is fully justified by reference to the totality of the rights provided for in the Covenant and in the context of the full use of the maximum available resources.[7]

16. The obligation to realize progressively the rights enshrined in the Covenant applies beyond the achievement of the minimum essential levels of each of the rights.[8] A key provision of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, article 11, paragraph 1, captures this idea when it recognizes a right to an adequate standard of living "and to the continuous improvement of living conditions". This wording explicitly underscores the duty to achieve sustained progress in the effective enjoyment of aspects necessary to live a dignified life, such as food, health, housing, clothing, water and sanitation.

Obligation to guarantee non-discrimination

17. An important obligation enshrined in all core international human rights treaties is the prohibition of discrimination in relation to all human rights. According to article 2, paragraph 2, of the Covenant, States parties "undertake to guarantee that the rights enunciated in the present Covenant will be exercised

[6] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 3, para. 2.

[7] See, inter alia Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 3, para. 9, general comment No. 12, para. 19, and general comment No. 14, paras. 32, 48 and 50. Some domestic courts have applied the prohibition of retrogression as a constitutional review standard. See, for example, Constitutional Court of Portugal, Decision No. 39/84, 11 April 1984.

[8] On the notion of "minimum core content" or "minimum core obligations", see Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 3, para. 10, general comment No. 13, para. 57, and general comment No. 19, para. 59, and report of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, E/2007/82, paras. 20-22.

without discrimination of any kind as to race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status."[9] Similar provisions are included in other relevant human rights instruments enshrining economic, social and cultural rights. This list of factors, or "forbidden grounds of discrimination", is, however, not exhaustive — as the use of the expression "other status" suggests. There could be other relevant grounds to consider. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights has mentioned, for example, disability, geographical residence, health status and sexual orientation as grounds that would also require a strict scrutiny if employed to make distinctions with the purpose or effect of impairing or nullifying the recognition, enjoyment or exercise of rights set forth by the Covenant.

18. The prohibition of discrimination imposes on States both negative and positive obligations. This means, on the one hand, a prohibition against engaging in discrimination, that is, against making de jure or de facto distinctions that have the intention or the effect of denying or restricting rights on the basis of any forbidden grounds. For example, States are not allowed to introduce differences in social security regimes or to establish restrictions in access to reproductive health information or education on the basis of religion, age or national origin.[10] On the other hand, the positive duty obliges the State party to eradicate existing discriminatory laws and practices, not only in respect of relations between individuals and the State, but also in respect of the market and in the private sphere — that is, in the relations between private individuals. For example, the State should prevent and punish discrimination in private workplaces.[11]

19. In order to comply with these obligations, the State needs to detect existing discriminatory norms and repeal them, identify current discriminatory practices and adopt normative and other types of measures to eradicate them, and ensure the adequate application of such measures both to itself and to private parties.

C. Implications of different types of obligation for implementation and monitoring of economic, social and cultural rights

20. The State is under an obligation to adopt measures to overcome situations where right holders are not enjoying their rights. Implementation means, in this context, the adoption of concrete measures — including legislative, administrative, financial and other kinds of measures — that would allow rights holders to enjoy their rights.

21. Similarly, a State is obliged to detect threats by its own agents or third parties to the enjoyment of the rights, and to prevent or counteract those threats. Implementation means, in this context, the adoption of adequate regulations, the provision of proper resources to oversee the conduct of State agents and third parties

---

[9] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, forty-second session, general comment No. 20: non-discrimination in economic, social and cultural rights (art. 2, para. 2) (E/C.12/GC/20).

[10] See, for example, Human Rights Committee, *Zwaan-de Vries v. the Netherlands*, Communication 182/1984, views of 9 April 1987.

[11] See, for example, Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, *Ylimaz Dogman v. the Netherlands*, Communication 1/1984 (29 September 1988).

(such as labour or education inspectorates) and the effective imposition of sanctions where needed.

22. Implementation of economic, social and cultural rights implies transformative action oriented towards ensuring the full enjoyment of rights, or preventive action to prevent a potential violation or a remedial action to offer redress when rights have been violated. Monitoring implementation is an indispensable means to assess whether these required types of action are actually taking place and are sufficient, or are absent. Failure to adopt adequate transformative or preventive action may amount to a violation of the rights at stake.

23. States are also obliged to refrain from acting in a way that threatens or undermines the actual state of enjoyment of rights by right holders. In this context, monitoring requires the verification as to whether the State is not weakening or putting at risk, through its actions, the already consolidated link between right holders and their rights. For example, it is important to monitor the potential negative impact of proposed legislative or policy measures -- such as the effects of development-based projects on the right to housing or the effects of decentralization of services on the right to education.

24. Evaluating the obligation of progressive realization requires monitoring to measure achievements, detect failures, gaps and retrogression, and reorient State action when needed. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights has emphasized that monitoring is indeed an integral and indispensable aspect of a State party's obligations under the Covenant.[12] Implementation of measures to achieve the realization of economic, social and cultural rights should be seen as a process, rather than as a distinct event. The concepts of "progressive realization" and of "continual improvement of living conditions" suggest that it is an open-ended process. Therefore, the need to monitor the realization of economic, social and cultural rights remains continuous for all States regardless of their level of development.

25. Monitoring is particularly relevant to identifying discriminatory laws, policies, programmes and practices, with a view to their eradication, an assessment of their outcomes and impacts, or their revision and reorientation. The eradication of discrimination against marginalized and excluded groups requires special attention to assess the difficulties that they have in enjoying certain rights. Monitoring gaps in the enjoyment of rights by certain groups requires, in turn, the collection of disaggregated data. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights has stressed the importance of the disaggregation of data and its systematic updating, as an indispensable means for identifying gaps in the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights, and in order to design adequate corrective measures.[13]

26. Data can be disaggregated by innumerable factors. While it would be ideal to disaggregate data by all possible grounds of discrimination, this is not always possible. Notwithstanding, States should make efforts to disaggregate data at least by age, gender, relevant demographic group (e.g., ethnicity, language, religion or

[12] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 14, para. 43 (f); general comment No. 15, para. 37 (g); and general comment No. 19, para. 59 (f).

[13] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 13, para. 37 and general comment No. 19, para. 75.

migrant status), socio-economic status and geographical factors (urban/rural populations and territorial divisions).

III. Monitoring approaches and methods

A. Monitoring legislation and normative institutional frameworks

27. Legislative measures are considered in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights as being particularly appropriate for giving effect to economic, social and cultural rights. Several Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comments have emphasized the crucial role of legislation in ensuring the enjoyment of different rights.[14] Giving content to rights through publicly known, general and objective rules is a fundamental aspect of the rule of law.

28. Normative measures to put into practice economic, social and cultural rights are not restricted to legislation or administrative regulations as such. Policies, plans of action and programmes also define State commitment and obligations and complement legislation and regulations by defining policy principles and goals, resources, target groups, time lines and lines of action.

29. Monitoring legislation and normative frameworks usually includes two kinds of questions. The first is whether legislative and other necessary normative measures have been actually adopted. Failure to adopt legislation and necessary normative measures to realize economic, social and cultural rights amounts to a violation of international human rights obligations by omission. For example, it may be insufficient to include the right to food in a constitution if no secondary legislation and regulations are adopted to give a concrete content to the right, identify the duty bearers and provide remedial mechanisms in case of violation.

30. Once legislation and other normative measures have been adopted, the question is whether they comply with international human rights standards. At least two kinds of shortcoming could be envisaged. The first is the incompatibility of domestic legislation and other normative measures with those standards, because of the infringement of a prohibition. For example, legislation that restricts the rights of a group on the basis of forbidden factors is in breach of the prohibition of discrimination, and thus incompatible with international human rights law. Domestic and international courts and quasi-judicial bodies have considered such kind of violations regarding different economic, social and cultural rights.[15]

31. The second consideration is the possible inadequacy of legislation and other normative measures. Inadequate or inappropriate legislative and normative measures

[14] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 14, paras. 35, 36 and 56; general comment No. 15, paras. 23, 26 and 50; general comment No. 16, paras. 19, 24 and 30; general comment No. 18, paras. 10, 18, 22, 24, 25 and 38; and general comment No. 19, paras. 45, 46, 48, 51, 67 and 72.

[15] See, for example, Constitutional Court of South Africa, *Khosa and others v. Minister of Social Development and others*, 2001 (1) SA 46 (CC), 4 March 2004; United States Supreme Court, *Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka*, 347 US 483 (1954); Corte de Apelaciones (Court of Appeals) of Guatemala acting as *amparo* tribunal, Third chamber, Amparo No. 46-2003 Of. 1., 30 October 2003.

are those failing to meet a required standard. This may mean that legislation and other normative measures can be considered as partially adequate, but do not take into consideration all relevant elements.

32. International human rights standards require States to include in legislative and normative measures a specific substantive content. Some components of the concept of "minimum core content" are good examples of substantive requirements; for example, the right to health requires the State "to provide essential drugs",[16] and the right to education requires the State "to provide primary education for all".[17] If no provision is made in this respect in the legislative and normative framework, States may not have complied with their duty legally to ensure these core aspects of the respective rights. Similarly, legislative and other policy measures should be appropriate and reasonable, that is, adequate instruments to achieve the goals they have the purpose to serve. Legislation and policy measures in the field of economic, social and cultural rights have been found inadequate or unreasonable, for example, when they failed to consider the situation of the most vulnerable or marginalized groups being unjustifiably excluded from certain treatments under a health plan, or when they were considerably insufficient to cover the demands they aimed to provide for.[18]

33. There are also procedural requirements prescribed by international human rights standards. The institutional framework and the procedures to implement economic, social and cultural rights should include mechanisms for the participation of the relevant stakeholders, ensure access to information and transparency, establish accountability mechanisms, respect due process in decision-making, and provide remedies in case of violations. Failure to duly include mechanisms to satisfy these procedural requirements may also amount to violations of international obligations.[19]

B. Monitoring the realization of economic, social and cultural rights

34. The adoption of legislation, regulations, policies, plans and programmes does not amount automatically to the realization of economic, social and cultural rights. Realization requires action to translate the specific commitments included in legislation and other normative instruments into reality. It is thus important to develop tools to assess the appropriateness of the measures adopted by the State to implement rights, as well as the achieved results. Monitoring realization requires tools that are capable of measuring results and progress over time. There are a number of available techniques that facilitate such an evaluation.

---

[16] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, general comment No. 14, para. 43 (d).

[17] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, general comment No. 13, para. 57.

[18] See Constitutional Court of South Africa, *The Government of the Republic of South Africa and others v. Irene Grootboom and others*, 2001 (1) SA 46 (CC), 4 October 2000; Supreme Court of Argentina, *Asociación de Esclerosis Múltiple de Salta v. Ministerio de Salud s/amparo*, 1 June 2003; and European Committee of Social Rights, *International Association Autism-Europe v. France*, Complaint 13/2002, decision on the merits of 7 November 2003.

[19] See, for example, Constitutional Court of Colombia, Decision C-030/08, 23 January 2008; and European Committee of Social Rights, *European Federation of National Organisations Working with the Homeless v. France*, Complaint 39/2006, decision on the merits of 4 February 2008.

Human rights impact assessments

35. Impact assessments are evaluations used to predict the future consequences of proposed policies, programmes and projects in order to address shortcomings before they are adopted or implemented. They can also be conducted to assess whether a certain policy, programme or project had the intended positive impact or whether the impact was negative. Therefore, impact assessments are conducted before the adoption of policies, programmes or projects take place, or after they have been implemented. Specifically, human rights impact assessments seek to aid Governments in choosing between alternatives, making modifications, and providing for mitigating measures in order to respect, protect and fulfil human rights. Human rights impact assessment help Governments to adopt and implement policies, programmes and projects that will best meet their obligations to take deliberate and concrete steps towards progressive realization of human rights.[20] Human rights treaty bodies have recommended that States parties conduct human rights impact assessments in relation to their treaty obligations, including economic, social and cultural rights. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, for example, has recommended that human rights impact assessments "be made an integral part of every proposed piece of legislation or policy initiative on a basis analogous to environmental impact assessments or statement" (E/C.12/1/Add.19, para. 33; see also CRC/C/15/Add.114, para. 13).

36. While the concept of a human rights impact assessment is relatively recent, other kinds of impact assessment have been carried out in different areas. For example, environmental impact assessments and social impact analyses are well-established practices and extensive literature discusses various approaches and methodologies. These can provide useful guidance when developing techniques for conducting human rights impact assessments.

37. The need to adjust the methodology of an impact assessment to the nature of the proposed measure, to take explicitly into consideration the human rights obligations at stake and to ensure the participation of all the relevant stakeholders is crucial.[21] Even if it is not possible to prescribe a single model for conducting human rights impact assessments, some practical steps to be considered, inspired by other kinds of impact assessment, are: (a) carrying out a preliminary check to determine the need for the assessment; (b) preparing an assessment plan, which should involve all the relevant stakeholders and provide them with the necessary information about the proposed measures and specific details of the rights and obligations at stake; (c) collecting the relevant information from the stakeholders; (d) performing a rights analysis by comparing the information collected with the relevant human rights obligations of the State; (e) circulating the draft analysis of the rights to all stakeholders and debating alternatives with them; and (f) making the final decisions,

[20] See P. Hunt and G. MacNaughton, "Impact assessments, poverty and human rights: a case study using the right to the highest attainable standard of health", Health and Human Rights Working Paper Series No. 6 (World Health Organization, May 2006). For a comprehensive review of the issue, see G. de Beco, "Human rights impact assessment", Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights, vol. 27, No. 2 (2009).

[21] See, for example, Humanist Committee for Human Rights, Health Rights of Women Assessment Instrument (2006); and International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, *Initiative on Human Rights and Impact Assessment* (2005).

adopting policy measures according to the assessment and establishing mechanisms to evaluate the policy implementation and results.[22]

38. The Women's Global Network for Reproductive Rights offers a good example of the use of human rights impact assessments. That organization conducted an assessment to analyse the impact on women's right to health of a draft bill on obstetric care for undocumented pregnant migrants in the Netherlands. The purpose of the proposed legislation was to create a more uniform compensation system, but the proposed measures had the effect of reducing access to health facilities for undocumented pregnant migrants and compromising access to prenatal health care. The bill also created disparities between groups of users of medical services.[23]

Use of indicators and benchmarks for monitoring

39. Indicators and benchmarks are important ways to monitor progress, stagnation or retrogression in the realization of a given right over a certain period of time, for example the period between the consideration of two successive periodic reports by a treaty body.

40. Since the report of the High Commissioner for Human Rights on progressive realization of economic, social and cultural rights was issued (E/2007/82), the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights has made progress in developing a conceptual framework of qualitative and quantitative human rights indicators, including illustrative indicators for selected economic, social and cultural rights — the right to food, the right to health, the right to education, the right to adequate housing, the right to social security and the right to work (see HRI/MC/2008/3, annex I).

41. The selection of appropriate indicators for each right will facilitate the use of benchmarks as a concrete yardstick to assess progress. Benchmarks constitute concrete values of given quantitative indicators, which are used as targets or measurable goals that States parties commit themselves to achieve in a given period of time; for example, to reduce the incidence of maternal mortality or school drop-out rates. Benchmarks can help State parties in designing the appropriate measures and apportioning the necessary resources and they offer better parameters to monitor the adequacy of the State's efforts to realize rights.

42. Consistent monitoring through the use of indicators and benchmarks allows progress in realizing economic, social and cultural rights to be measured with a more accurate set of conceptual tools. The use of indicators and benchmarks improves the effectiveness of international monitoring by treaty bodies and can enhance the capacity of States parties to assess and improve the results of policies, plans and programmes. The adoption of a consistent set of indicators and public commitment to attaining some measurable benchmarks, enhance the transparency and accountability of State policies vis-à-vis civil society and other national and international stakeholders. The use of statistical information acknowledged by the State constitutes a possible source of evidence in court settings and has a key

[22] See P. Hunt and G. MacNaughton, op. cit., pp. 37-46.

[23] See A. Wubben, "Violations of human rights in the Netherlands: HeRWAI analysis on the consequences of the implementation of the draft bill, modification Health Care Insurance Law (31 249), on the access to obstetrician care for uninsured and undocumented pregnant migrants in Amsterdam (Amsterdam Women's Global Network for Reproductive Rights, 2008).

function in litigation in certain areas, such as indirect discrimination and so-called structural litigation.

43. Using statistical information to monitor human rights requires States to produce information aimed specifically at monitoring compliance with human rights obligations. In addition, in order to allow monitoring by civil society organizations and other stakeholders, information produced by the State should be publicly accessible.[24] While the use of indicators is a useful tool, it has certain limitations. Problems such as lack of information, difficulties with respect to disaggregation of data and the risk of understanding only a limited part of the picture of rights fulfilment call for combining indicators with other sources of information to assess the realization of economic, social and cultural rights.

Budget analysis

44. This section of the report presents considerations on the use of budgetary analysis as a tool for monitoring the realization of economic, social and cultural rights, complementing the earlier report of the High Commissioner for Human Rights on progressive realization (E/2007/82).

45. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, in its article 2, paragraph 1, requires a State party to take steps "to the maximum of its available resources" to achieve the full realization of economic, social and cultural rights. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights has underscored that "appropriate measures" to achieve such full realization include "financial" measures.[25]

46. As for all human rights, achieving economic, social and cultural rights requires budget allocations and corresponding expenditures, in particular in regard to the positive obligations that they entail. The provision of educational services, the promotion and facilitation of the enjoyment of the right to food, the monitoring of the duties of employers regarding workers' rights, for instance, necessarily require financial resources, sustainable over time. Therefore, the budget — as the instrument that determines the extent of the State's resources, their allocation and prospective expenditures — is particularly relevant for the realization of economic, social and cultural rights. The budget is a useful source of information to evaluate which normative commitments are taken seriously by the State, because it provides a demonstration of the State's preferences, priorities and trade-offs in spending. For example, low apportionments in health care, education or social programmes when there are visible implementation gaps could show inadequate prioritization or insufficient estimation of the required funds to realize economic, social and cultural rights.

47. There are different ways to conduct budget analysis, depending on the objective.[26]

---

[24] See, for example, Inter-American Court of Human Rights, *Claude-Reyes v. Chile*, 19 September 2006, para. 77.

[25] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 3, para. 7.

[26] See, generally, Fundar — Centro de Análisis e Investigación, International Human Rights Internship Program and International Budget Project (2004).

48. Firstly, budget analysis can be static or dynamic. Static analysis evaluates a given budget by itself. Dynamic analysis compares the evolution of budgets over time, looking at variations in allocations and spending over different periods.

49. Static analysis provides direct information about the resources available for States to carry out their mandates. A second, relatively simple step in the static analysis of budgets from the perspective of economic, social and cultural rights consists in identifying the allocation of resources for each specific right as provided for in different sectors, in comparison with the totality of resources; this distribution by itself offers an interesting means for comparison and evaluation. Mapping the allocation of resources for social security, health or food policies and comparing them with the percentage of other allocations gives a general sense of the relative Government priorities expressed through the budget.

50. Breaking up the resource allocation in each specific area also offers an important indication about what are the priorities. Economic, social and cultural rights require special attention for vulnerable, marginalized and discriminated groups. One possible approach to budget analysis consists of mapping the main beneficiaries of some budget allocations. For example, when systems and services that satisfy economic, social and cultural rights — such as the health or the educational systems — are segmented, and each segment serves different sections of the population, comparing how resources are distributed may be revealing. If a significant percentage of the education budget is allocated to subsidizing private schools that cater for children from middle and high-income families compared with public schools serving low-income sectors of the population, the analysis would suggest that the Government's priorities may not be in line with its international obligations.

51. Some civil society groups and United Nations organizations have developed specific methodologies to analyse budget implications for particular social groups, such as women or children.[27] Similarly, geographic disaggregation of allocations, in comparison with the resources and needs of each area, can also inform arguments about inadequate distribution.

52. Such approaches can be made sharper by comparing allocations in each area with specific recommendations or benchmarks linked to identifying a lack of realization of rights. Recommendations or benchmarks can be expressed in terms of resources, for example, how much would it cost to achieve a specific goal such as reducing the percentage of children out of school or extending the coverage of the health system to remote areas. This technique, sometimes called "costing out", offers a parameter to test both the adequacy of the resources that have been apportioned by the State and their distribution, and may reveal the need to resort to additional resources, such as new taxes or international assistance and cooperation, in order to achieve proposed benchmarks.

53. Budget analysis may sometimes prove to be a challenging exercise, as economic, social and cultural rights as such are not necessarily broken down within the State budget lines. Furthermore, funds allocated for other rights can be related to or have an impact on economic, social and cultural ones. For example, birth

[27] See, for example, United Nations Development Fund for Women, *Budgeting for Women's Rights: Monitoring Government Budgets for Compliance with CEDAW*, New York, 2006.

registration is a civil right that also relates to the enjoyment of all rights, including health, social welfare and education.

54. Dynamic budgetary analysis offers other ways to evaluate efforts to implement obligations regarding economic, social and cultural rights. A simple but important distinction in dynamic short-term budgetary analysis is the difference between budgeted spending and actual spending: comparing spending with budgetary provisions offers an important tool to evaluate State commitment to realizing economic, social and cultural rights. For instance, underspending in an area where some targets have not been met or in instances when indicators show significant gaps in the full realization of economic, social and cultural rights, may indicate a lack of compliance with the obligation to take steps "to the maximum of [a State's] available resources". Similarly, consistent underspending in one social sector, such as education or health, over a number of years may actually indicate that planning is inadequate or that funds for the sector are not released promptly, rendering it impossible to use the allocated resources in time.

C. Monitoring violations of economic, social and cultural rights

55. A different but related perspective to monitoring realization of rights is that of monitoring violations. As do any other human rights, economic, social and cultural rights create legal obligations for States and non-compliance with those obligations amounts to violation of the rights. Individuals and groups of individuals can be victims of such violations.

56. While monitoring the realization of rights requires the assessment of a continual process, monitoring violations is usually linked with recording and documenting specific events. The former tends to be conducted through the analysis of socio-economic and other administrative statistics, while the latter is often related to event-based data (see HRI/MC/2008/3, paras. 13 and 14). This distinction requires some qualification.

57. Firstly, socio-economic and other administrative statistics may be useful or even essential to describe a violation accurately. For example, claims of indirect discrimination require proof of a detrimental, disparate impact on the enjoyment of a right on a specific group in comparison with another group, such as women in relation to men or members of an ethnic minority in relation to the majority of the population. Statistics and quantitative information may also be employed to describe other violations, such as the inadequacy of education, the systematic character of forced evictions, or failure to adopt measures to implement legal obligations. They can also be useful to prove that the State has not complied with its duties, despite the existence of available resources.

58. Secondly, not all violations can be accurately characterized as "events": since economic, social and cultural rights entail both negative and positive obligations, violations can take the form of State actions, but can also occur by inaction or omission. In these cases, the term "event-based data" can be misleading, because the violation consists of a failure to act, such as failure to implement a food policy or to establish a labour inspectorate to monitor compliance with safety and health regulations in workplaces.

59. A further distinction can also clarify different types of violation through State action. A State can breach a human rights obligation when adopting legislation or regulations that are incompatible with human rights standards. These are normative violations. An example would be the adoption of legislation that is discriminatory or that is deliberately retrogressive without adequate justification. A State can also breach a human rights obligation by action when not complying in fact with an existing prohibition: these are factual violations. This would be the case, for example, if State agents were to discriminate in the provision of social services in contravention of existing anti-discrimination legislation. In either case, documenting violations by action in the case of economic, social and cultural rights is not substantively different from the traditional documentation of violation of civil and political rights.

60. Obligations to respect economic, social and cultural rights are usually described as prohibitions on interference with the current enjoyment of a right by the right holder, and their breach can offer good examples of violations of the right by State action. For instance, forced evictions, discriminatory exclusion from health services, the adoption of legislation restricting the right to form and join trade unions without proper justification or pollution of water by State agents are illustrative examples of such violations. The adoption of deliberate, retrogressive measures, such as legislative measures reducing the coverage of mandatory health plans or reintroducing fees for primary schools are also concrete examples of such measures.

61. Violations by omission can be either normative violations or factual violations. Normative omissions, also called "legal gaps", occur, for instance, when there is an obligation to enact legislation or regulations to give effect to a right and the obligation is not complied with. Legal gaps are especially relevant in the field of economic, social and cultural rights, because the effective enjoyment of rights depends to a great extent on the clear definition of legal entitlements and obligations. In many countries in the world, while the constitution and ratified human rights treaties prescribe a duty to ensure economic, social and cultural rights, no legislation has been adopted to translate them into concrete entitlements. Factual omissions or "implementation gaps" consist of non-compliance with a mandate to do something that is already provided by law, such as providing medication, ensuring sufficient school places for children or effectively monitoring compliance with safety and health regulations by private employers. There exists a need to improve techniques of documentation of violations by omission, which will benefit the monitoring of all human rights.

62. Another issue to consider is violations that have a collective or systemic effect. Compliance with positive obligations regarding economic, social and cultural rights often requires collective arrangements, solutions or remedies. Reasons of cost and scale determine the need to plan services and programmes taking into consideration groups or collectives, not only isolated individuals. For example, the right to have access to educational or medical services cannot be conceived as a right to one teacher per student, or one physician per patient, but as a right to have access to facilities and services that cater for a certain segment of the population.

63. In other words, fulfilment of some aspects of individual rights is a function of a collective arrangement. When adequate facilities and services do not exist, or when they fail to deliver adequately, all the members of the group that they should

serve are affected by such shortcomings. For example, the lack of provision of an adequate number of places in primary school in a certain district affects all the children that should benefit from the schools. An inadequate number of health-care personnel at health centres affects the entire group of users of those facilities. Inadequate sanitation or water services have an impact on the enjoyment of all users. In these cases, providing adequate remedies even for individual violations usually involves collective decisions, capable of addressing the root cause of the breach.

64. One common way to monitor violations of economic, social and cultural rights is by keeping a record of the complaints filed by alleged victims before relevant judicial or quasi-judicial complaints mechanisms, such as court cases and complaints before national human rights institutions or administrative bodies. While in some jurisdictions economic, social and cultural rights are still not considered justiciable and adequate remedies for alleged breaches of these rights have not been provided, failure to provide such adequate remedies may itself amount to a violation of international obligations regarding economic, social and cultural rights.[28]

65. A growing amount of national case law in the field of economic, social and cultural rights has shown the potential of courts and quasi-judicial bodies to detect violations, reveal shortcomings in the design or implementation of public policies and offer redress to victims.

66. Often, violations of economic, social and cultural rights are intertwined with violations of the right to an adequate remedy and to a fair trial. Moreover, due compliance with judicial orders in the field of economic, social and cultural rights is particularly important because of the vital interests and pressing circumstances that the violation of such rights involves. Domestic and international courts and quasi-judicial bodies have stressed the importance of speedy procedures and timely compliance with court decisions related to wages, pensions, work-related injuries, medical interventions, school enrolment and forced evictions, among others. Monitoring the adequacy and effectiveness of judicial remedies in the field of economic, social and cultural rights will also offer an important indication of the degree to which the State honours its obligations regarding these rights.

67. Litigation in the field of economic, social and cultural rights has highlighted the need to extend monitoring to the implementation of court orders. In cases where the required remedy is complex and may entail the modification of laws, regulations and plans or provision of new services or new budgetary allocations, the implementation of court orders can take a long time. A number of emblematic cases from different jurisdictions illustrate the specific requirements of complex or structural litigation in the field of economic, social and cultural rights. Interestingly, these challenges have led to new procedural developments, such as appointing court commissioners, assigning monitoring functions to national human rights institutions,

[28] See Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights general comment No. 9, paras. 2-8, 10 and 14. See also Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, "Access to justice as a guarantee of economic, social and cultural rights: a review of the standards adopted by the inter-American system of human rights", OEA/Ser.L/V/II.129, Doc. 4, 7 September 2007.

or developing specific indicators for the political branches to report on progress in the implementation of judicial orders to the courts.[29]

68. The adoption of the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights represents a groundbreaking step. It will offer the possibility to individuals and groups of individuals under the jurisdiction of State parties to both the Covenant and the Optional Protocol to submit to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights communications on alleged violations of any of the rights set forth by the Covenant, given certain conditions, including the exhaustion of domestic remedies. It also allows the Committee to initiate inquiries when it receives reliable information of grave and systematic violation by a State party of any of the rights recognized by the Covenant, provided that the concerned State has explicitly accepted this competence. Once in force, the Optional Protocol will help to define the content of the rights in concrete situations and further support the development of national case law.

69. Documenting and making public violations of economic, social and cultural rights — especially those violations that have a collective impact — can be important tools for prompting a response from the responsible authorities. Civil society organizations and national human rights institutions play a fundamental role in such work of documentation and public discussion, as does the media. Some institutional mechanisms, such as inquiries conducted by parliamentary committees or independent agencies, also offer opportunities for monitoring violations.

IV. Conclusions

70. The present report offers some guidance concerning the relevance of implementation and monitoring in the area of economic, social and cultural rights. While implementation and monitoring are important for all human rights, some special characteristics of economic, social and cultural rights benefit from specific clarification. These include the spectrum of obligations stemming from economic, social and cultural rights, the concept of "progressive realization" and the obligation to strictly guarantee non-discrimination in the enjoyment of those rights.

71. The report reviews different ways of monitoring economic, social and cultural rights. Monitoring the legislation and the normative framework adopted to implement economic, social and cultural rights requires assessing whether legislation and other normative measures have been adopted to give effect to these rights and whether they comply with the substantive and procedural obligations required by international human rights law.

72. Monitoring realization of economic, social and cultural rights can also be achieved through assessing progress, stagnation or retrogression in the full enjoyment of those rights over time. This could be done through human rights impact assessments in order to foresee the possible consequences of adopting and implementing specific measures on economic, social and cultural rights. Human

[29] See, for example, Constitutional Court of Colombia, Decision A-027/2007, 1 February 2007; Supreme Court of India, *People's Union for Civil Liberties v. Union of India and others*, 2 May 2003; and Federal Administrative Court of Argentina, Chamber IV (Cámara Nacional en lo Contencioso Administrativo Federal, Sala IV), *Viceconte, Mariela Cecilia c/Estado Nacional, Ministerio de Salud y Acción Social*, 2 June 1998.

rights impact assessments require consultation among and the participation of all the relevant stakeholders.

73. Another method to monitor progressive realization is the use of quantitative indicators and benchmarks. The development of a framework of indicators and the adoption of illustrative indicators have considerably advanced over the past years.

74. The report also proposes an analysis of budgets, which represent an indispensable instrument for the realization of economic, social and cultural rights, but also an important showcase for a State's policy choices and priorities. Budget analysis can be useful to assess if the State's commitments are adequately translated into practice through its allocation of resources and expenditure. Budget analysis offers ways to investigate what is "the maximum of the available resources" of a particular State party.

75. Finally, the report also addresses monitoring violations of economic, social and cultural rights. Such violations can occur by State action or omission. Monitoring violations of economic, social and cultural rights can be achieved through recording complaints filed before judicial and quasi-judicial mechanisms. In State parties where the possibility of submitting complaints is limited or non-existent, civil society organizations and other stakeholders usually document violations, especially those with a collective impact. The entry into force of the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights will strengthen monitoring of violations at the international level.

United Nations E/2009/91

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
5 June 2009

Original: English

Substantive session of 2009
Geneva, 6-31 July 2009
Item 14 (a) of the provisional agenda*
Social and human rights questions: advancement of women

Note by the Secretariat

1. The present note is submitted pursuant to article 21 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, which states that the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women shall report annually on its activities to the General Assembly, through the Economic and Social Council.

2. A report on the results of the forty-second and forty-third sessions of the Committee (E/CN.6/2009/CRP.1) is available in English only on the website of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (www.ohchr.org). The reports of those sessions will be made available to the General Assembly in all official languages of the United Nations in Supplement No. 38 (A/64/38).

* E/2009/100.

09-36084 (E) 110609

Please recycle

United Nations E/2009/92

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
10 June 2009

Original: English

Substantive session of 2009
Geneva, 6-31 July 2009
Item 13 (b) of the provisional agenda*
Economic and environmental questions: science and technology for development

Enhanced cooperation on public policy issues pertaining to the Internet

Report of the Secretary-General

Summary

The General Assembly, in its resolution 63/202, requested the Secretary-General to submit to the Economic and Social Council at its substantive session of 2009, on the basis of his consultations with all relevant organizations, including international organizations, a report that might contain recommendations on how the process towards enhanced cooperation on public policy issues pertaining to the Internet should be pursued.

The present report responds to that request and seeks to take stock of steps taken to enhance cooperation and to summarize recommendations proposed by all relevant organizations on the way forward.

* E/2009/100.

09-36604 (E) 300609

Please recycle

I. Background

1. The World Summit on the Information Society took place in 2003 in Geneva, and in 2005 in Tunis. The Summit adopted four outcome documents: the Geneva Declaration of Principles (see A/C.2/59/3, annex), the Geneva Plan of Action (ibid.), the Tunis Commitment (see A/60/687) and the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society (ibid.). In these documents, Internet governance, carried out according to the Geneva Declaration of Principles, is recognized as an essential element for a people-centred, inclusive, development-oriented and non-discriminatory Information Society. In particular, the Summit, in paragraph 69 of the Tunis Agenda recognized "the need for enhanced cooperation in the future, to enable governments, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet, but not in the day-to-day technical and operational matters, that do not impact on international public policy issues". In paragraph 71 of the Tunis Agenda, the United Nations Secretary-General is requested to initiate a continuous process of enhanced cooperation by engaging the relevant stakeholders, including Governments, the private sector, civil society, academia and practitioners.

2. The General Assembly, in its resolution 63/202, encouraged strengthened and continuing cooperation between and among stakeholders to ensure effective implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit, and encouraged United Nations entities, within their respective mandates, to contribute to the implementation of the outcomes of the Summit, and emphasized the need for resources in that regard. Recognizing the urgent need to harness the potential of knowledge and technology, the Assembly encouraged the United Nations development system to continue its effort to promote the use of information and communications technologies as a critical enabler of development and a catalyst for the achievement of the internationally agreed development goals, including the Millennium Development Goals. In that context, the Assembly also requested the Secretary-General to submit to the Economic and Social Council at its substantive session of 2009, on the basis of his consultations with all relevant organizations, including international organizations, a report that might contain recommendations on how the process towards enhanced cooperation should be pursued.

II. Review of steps taken towards enhanced cooperation

A. Progress towards implementation of paragraph 71 of the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society

3. In response to paragraph 71 of the Tunis Agenda, the Special Adviser to the Secretary-General for Internet Governance carried out a series of bilateral discussions in 2006 with the representatives of all stakeholder groups — Governments, the private sector, civil society and the technical and academic communities. In 2007, the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs was entrusted by the Secretary-General to continue the consultation process and to facilitate the reporting process on enhanced cooperation on public policy issues pertaining to the Internet. On 12 March 2008, the Under-Secretary-General for Economic and Social Affairs invited 10 organizations to provide an annual

performance report on the steps they had undertaken towards enhanced cooperation on Internet-related public policy issues pertaining to the Internet.[1]

4. A summary of the responses has been incorporated into the report of the Secretary-General on progress made in the implementation of and follow-up to the World Summit on the Information Society outcomes at the regional and international levels (A/64/64-E/2009/10).

5. All organizations reported that they had made efforts to reach out to other stakeholders. The Government-led organizations had undertaken activities to broaden cooperation with business, civil society and the Internet community. Meanwhile, the Internet community organizations reported on their outreach to Governments, business and civil society. Almost all organizations indicated that they had actively participated in the Internet Governance Forum, and most of them (including the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN), the Internet Society (ISOC), the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) were also represented in the Multi-stakeholder Advisory Group of the Forum. A number of organizations (including the Council of Europe, ISOC, ITU, OECD, UNESCO and the World Wide Web Consortium (W3C) participated in the creation of Dynamic Coalitions within the Forum.

6. Organizations highlighted capacity-building events such as educational programmes, conferences and workshops. Several organizations indicated a focus on facilitating multi-stakeholder dialogue. Reference was made by some to participation in forums developing Internet governance procedures and policies, with the Council of Europe outlining its responsibility for facilitating the negotiation of treaties on Internet policy. The World Intellectual Property Organization highlighted its extensive contribution in mediating intellectual property disputes with regard to domain naming, and ITU referred to its work on uniting existing cybersecurity initiatives to provide an overarching framework for multi-stakeholder consensus on a coordinated set of actions to strengthen cybersecurity on a global basis.

7. The performance reports suggest that the call for enhanced cooperation stated in the Tunis Agenda had been taken seriously by respondents.

8. Several common elements have emerged from experience to date. Most organizations interpret enhanced cooperation as a process to facilitate and contribute to multi-stakeholder dialogue, through formal or informal cooperative arrangements. The forms of cooperation that have emerged range from information and experience-sharing, consensus-building and fund-raising to the transfer of technical knowledge and capacity-building. Some of these global, regional and national cooperative arrangements are already in place among the 10 organizations.

---

[1] These organizations are: Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN), International Telecommunication Union (ITU), World Wide Web Consortium (W3C), Council of Europe, Internet Society (ISOC), Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO) and Number Resource Organization (NRO). One additional organization, the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF), submitted a contribution of its own accord.

9. One challenge to the effective monitoring of progress towards implementation of paragraph 71 of the Tunis Agenda is the absence of practical guidance on what constitutes an enhanced level of cooperation.

B. Recommendations for enhanced cooperation

10. On 23 December 2008, the Under-Secretary-General for Economic and Social Affairs again wrote to the same group of 10 institutions, with a further request for their recommendations on how the process towards enhanced cooperation should be pursued. Of the 10 organizations that were requested to submit their recommendations, responses were received from ICANN, ITU, W3C, the Council of Europe, ISOC and OECD. These responses are summarized in the table below. Excerpts of these responses are incorporated in the annex and will be made available online at http://www.unpan.org.

Recommendations	*Organizations*
• It is important for all stakeholders, in particular Governments and civil society, to continue to attend the various Internet governance forums and to participate actively in their respective processes.	ICANN
• ICANN believes that the progress made since the World Summit amply demonstrates the advantages of not trying to impose the constraints of a single controlling mechanism; rather, all stakeholders should continue to encourage the evolution of existing organizations.	
• The current Internet governance framework could be enhanced to ensure that Governments play a greater and more active role in the formulation of international public policy for information and communications technologies. Such measures could ensure better cooperation between Governments and other stakeholders in the policy formulation process.	ITU
• There already exist intergovernmental bodies under the United Nations umbrella with the strong participation of Governments, as well as the experience and the necessary mandate. Improving the governance framework, rather than attempting to create new frameworks, could leverage the existing entities to enhance Government participation.	
• Caution must be exercised when suggesting that the Internet Governance Forum could play a decision-making role or provide oversight functions in Internet-related public policy issues. Such activities do not fall within the mandate of the Forum, according to paragraph 77 of the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society, which states that the Forum would have no oversight function and would not replace existing arrangements, mechanisms, institutions or organizations, but would involve them and take advantage of their expertise; that would be constituted as a neutral, non-duplicative and non-binding process; and that would have no involvement in day-to-day or technical operations of the Internet.	

Recommendations	*Organizations*
• An improved governance framework could be formed, in which all countries would have an equal say in Internet-related public policy issues and in the management of critical Internet resources.	
• An intergovernmental organization such as ITU has the necessary mandate and hence could play a leading role in the creation of this governance structure.	
• The role and functions related to policies governing the harmonized and global coordination of services for country-code top-level domains (ccTLDs) should be assumed by a relevant intergovernmental body with a mandate from Governments and experience in providing such services so that concerns and interests of sovereign States can be taken into account.	
• In the case of Internet governance-related public policies that diverge from international law and treaties, an intergovernmental organization could serve as the forum for discussions and agreements between the parties concerned. This forum, within the appropriate organization, would ensure that international laws and treaties are taken into consideration in the formulation and implementation of Internet-related public policies that could have an impact on the treaties and international laws governing international organizations.	
• The legitimate interests of each country, as expressed and defined by each country in diverse ways, regarding decisions affecting their ccTLDs, need to be respected, upheld and addressed through a flexible and improved framework and mechanisms. The delegating body could retain an advisory role, if required, at the request of the country concerned. Any difference that may arise between the two entities could be resolved through an international/intergovernmental organization with the necessary mandate.	
• Each professional community, technical professional, Government, civil society and industry should do what they are best at, and cooperate with other communities that have different expertise. Engineering communities should continue to define and develop technologies. Governments should define and enforce laws, and all stakeholders need to understand new technologies as they are developed. Engineers need to better understand social and ethical aspects of the new technologies being developed. All communities should keep in mind the overall mission of promoting the human rights of access to information and freedom of expression and communication.	W3C
• Governments should play an important role as sponsors and users of Internet technologies, but not as network architects. Governments and civil society need to create enabling environments.	

Recommendations	*Organizations*
• Allowances should be made for flexibility and innovation, and at the same time, efforts should focus on functional requirements, not technology-specific rules, which means that a rich cross-layer coordination is required.	
• The Internet Governance Forum should discuss the important topic of open standards for the Internet and the Web. Direct participation by any stakeholder in setting the technical and procedural agenda of organizations such as W3C should be encouraged. The United Nations should encourage its Member States to allocate more resources to every area (be it standards, accessibility, privacy, etc.) at the appropriate level.	
• Dialogue and enhanced cooperation between Governments on Internet public policy is to be recommended. Such cooperation should be enhanced to ensure that freedom of expression and access to information via the Internet is not compromised by private ownership and management of the Internet's critical resources. Equally important is the need to establish policy on the next steps/strategy for ICANN following its release from the Joint Project Agreement under which it is tasked to comply with a series of "responsibilities" deemed necessary for its release from official oversight of the Government of the United States of America.	Council of Europe
• Regional "bottom-up" style initiatives, such as the Pan-European Dialogue on Internet Governance (EuroDIG), should be supported and fostered as a catalyst for public policy; in this context, Governments, relevant intergovernmental organizations, international non-governmental organizations and representatives from civil society and the private sector should be encouraged to cooperate.	
• All stakeholders should take advantage of the opportunity to become more involved in Internet community organizations, which develop technical standards and discuss issues at the intersection of technology and policy.	ISOC
• It is vital for all stakeholders to take up the challenge by participating in these new forums, which are so critical to the responsible development of the Internet.	
• The United Nations should take steps, through its component organizations, to create awareness of the opportunities to engage with others in developing a holistic approach to Internet-related public policy principles. It should go even further by supporting capacity-building programmes to help Member States understand how best to become involved in relevant organizations, how and when they can contribute to discussions, and how to develop the expertise required to do so meaningfully. Support and encouragement from the United Nations could make local,	

Recommendations	*Organizations*
regional and global forums concerned with Internet technology and policy and their intersection more dynamic and inclusive.	
• The United Nations should take steps, through its component organizations, to create awareness of the opportunities to engage with others in developing a holistic approach to Internet-related public policy principles. It should go even further by supporting capacity-building programmes to help Member States understand how best to become involved in relevant organizations, how and when they can contribute to discussions, and how to develop the expertise required to do so meaningfully. Support and encouragement from the United Nations could make local, regional and global forums concerned with Internet technology and policy and their intersection more dynamic and inclusive.	
• Governments and international institutions should make their Internet policy-related and decision-making activities more open and inclusive of all stakeholders.	
• The United Nations should consider the OECD example of including the Internet technical community and civil society in their Internet-related policy work as a case study for increasing openness in its own organizations, and for recommending mechanisms that Member States could implement locally and regionally.	
• Efforts to enhance cooperation must be founded on a commitment to openness, inclusiveness and outreach, so that the entities that may be affected by decisions are able to participate in the development and implementation of those decisions.	
• Debates preceding a decision should be made much more open to all stakeholder contributions.	

Annex

Summary of specific in-text recommendations made by respondent organizations

Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)

Recommendations

With regard to the question on how the process towards enhanced cooperation should be pursued in the future, we believe that the continued evolution of current mechanisms is crucial. The continued collaboration and cooperation among respective entities and organizations on issues within their own mandates serves to encourage open consultation, and the evolution of new methodologies, while avoiding futile competition among agencies established to perform other tasks.

Some areas where we have seen encouraging developments recently include:

The Internet Governance Forum, an output of the World Summit process, has in three years already provided a platform for discussion on a wide range of Internet-related issues, reinforcing existing and providing for new cooperation among organizations. With open participation in the Forum, all stakeholders interested in attending and engaging have the opportunity to do so.

It is important for all stakeholders, particularly Governments and civil society, to continue to engage in the various Internet governance forums, and to participate actively in each other's processes.

The evolution of domain names is another example of the ongoing process of cooperation among respective stakeholders to reach a common perspective.

Other organizations are also taking steps to review their process and practices and new relationships are developing as a result.

ICANN believes that progress made since the World Summit amply demonstrates the advantages of not trying to impose the constraints of a single controlling mechanism. Rather we should all continue to encourage the evolution of existing organizations which is already under way. Building on existing developments will facilitate an enhanced cooperation unlike any seen before, as parties are encouraged to establish ways to work together to achieve joint, and often new and exciting objectives. Barriers to this healthy and vigorous process do still exist among some organizations. I believe your efforts to publicize the progress made to date while encouraging the open participation of all stakeholders will prove to be an important contribution towards building upon what we have already achieved in pursuit of enhanced cooperation.

International Telecommunication Union

Recommendations

Role of Governments in Internet governance

The current Internet governance framework could be enhanced to ensure greater and more active participation of Governments in the formulation of international public policy for information and communications technologies. Measures taken could ensure better cooperation between Governments and other stakeholders in the policy formulation process, pursuant to paragraph 68 of the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society, which recognizes that all Governments should have an equal role and responsibility for international Internet governance and for ensuring the stability, security and continuity of the Internet.

It should be noted that there already exist intergovernmental bodies under the United Nations umbrella that have strong participation of Governments, the experience and also the necessary mandate. An improved governance framework could leverage such existing structures to enhance Government participation, rather than attempting to create new ones. Also, caution must be exercised when suggesting that the Internet Governance Forum could play a decision-making role or provide oversight functions in Internet-related public policy issues. Such activities do not fall within the Forum's mandate, according to paragraph 77 of the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society, which states that the Forum would have no oversight function and would not replace existing arrangements, mechanisms, institutions or organizations, but would involve them and take advantage of their expertise; that would be constituted as a neutral, non-duplicative and non-binding process; and that would have no involvement in day-to-day or technical operations of the Internet.

Preventing capture of the Internet governance mechanism

An improved governance framework could be formed within which all countries would have an equal say in Internet-related public policy issues and in the management of critical Internet resources.

An intergovernmental organization such as the International Telecommunication Union (ITU) has the necessary mandate and hence could play a leading role in the creation of such a governance structure. Resolution 102 of the 2006 ITU Plenipotentiary Conference instructs the ITU Secretary-General to take the necessary steps for ITU to continue to play a facilitating role in the coordination of international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet, as expressed in paragraph 35 (d) of the Tunis Agenda, interacting as necessary with other intergovernmental organizations in these domains.

Management of critical Internet resources — domain name system security extensions (DNSSEC) root signing authority

The root signing authority is of critical importance to the security, stability and reliability of the Internet. The role and functions related to policies governing the harmonized and global coordination of such services for country-code top-level domains (ccTLDs) must be assumed by a relevant intergovernmental body with the

mandate from Governments and the experience in providing such services so that concerns and interests of sovereign States can be taken into account.

This delegation decision could be a result of coordination among all relevant stakeholders, through discussions and debates at appropriate forums such as intergovernmental council meetings.

Management of critical Internet resources — the management of generic top-level domains (gTLDs)

In the case of Internet governance-related public policies that diverge from international law and treaties, an intergovernmental organization could serve as the forum for discussions and agreements between the parties concerned. This forum, within the appropriate organization, would ensure that international laws and treaties are taken into consideration in the formulation and implementation of Internet-related public policies that could have an impact on the treaties and international laws governing international organizations.

Management of critical Internet resources — management of Internationalized domain name ccTLDs

A country would retain sole control over the management of its assigned ccTLD in accordance with paragraph 63 of the Tunis Agenda for the Information Society which states that countries should not be involved in decisions regarding another country's ccTLD; and that their legitimate interests, as expressed and defined by each country in diverse ways, regarding decisions affecting their ccTLDs, need to be respected, upheld and addressed through a flexible and improved framework and mechanism.

The delegating body could retain an advisory role, if required, at the request of the country concerned. Any difference that may arise between the two entities could be resolved through an international/intergovernmental organization with the necessary mandate.

World Wide Web Consortium

Recommendations

Each professional community, technical professional, Government, civil society and industry should do what they are best at, and cooperate with other communities that have different expertise. Engineering communities should continue to define and develop technologies. Governments should define and enforce laws, and all stakeholders need to understand new technologies as they are developed. Engineers need to better understand social and ethical aspects of the new technologies being developed. All communities should keep in mind the overall mission of promoting the human rights of access to information and freedom of expression and communication.

Governments should play an important role as sponsors and users of Internet technologies, but not as network architects. Governments and civil society need to create enabling environments. Regardless of the brilliance of technology, its benefits are unevenly distributed and ultimately depend on wise policy action to ensure equal access around the world.

The most unique challenge base technology providers (e.g. ICANN, IETF/ISOC, W3C) face is to develop a shared infrastructure of resources and standards for addressing issues that have significant social impact, but that also require technical expertise and operational consensus in order to do so effectively. Allowances should be made for flexibility and innovation, and at the same time, efforts should focus on functional requirements, not on technology-specific business, political or social rules, which means that a rich cross-layer coordination is required. This is where most of the limited "policy" time of a small entity such as W3C is spent.

W3C is also attempting to continue pushing the open standards agenda by participating more actively in the Internet Governance Forum Dynamic Coalition on Open Standards (IGF DCOS).

The Geneva Declaration of Principles states that standardization is one of the essential building blocks of the information society. The priority for W3C is that Internet organizations that have made and that continue to make the Internet a reality are engaged in that debate.

The work of W3C in the areas of internationalization and accessibility are examples of its desire to include all users and all cultures, and to reach out and assemble the right constituencies for the future development of this revolutionary platform.

In 2008, in the area of enhanced cooperation, it is worth mentioning that W3C has finally created the World Wide Web Foundation, which it hopes will help to not only provide additional resources for web standards and science, including Internet governance and policy liaison issues, but also address the digital divide issues in the Tunis Agenda by starting "Web for Society" projects, which leverage the Web to empower people, especially those in underserved populations. The mission of the Foundation is to ensure that over the long term, the Web is accessible and useful to people from different cultures around the world with differing levels of language and literacy skills, including people with disabilities.

The Internet Governance Forum should discuss the important topic of open standards for the Internet and the Web. Direct participation by any stakeholder in setting the technical and procedural agenda of organizations such as W3C should be encouraged. The United Nations should encourage its Member States to allocate more resources to every area (be it standards, accessibility, privacy, etc.) at the appropriate level.

Council of Europe

Recommendations

Dialogue and enhanced cooperation between Governments

Dialogue and enhanced cooperation between Governments on Internet public policy is to be recommended. At the pan-European level, the Council of Europe will be establishing public policy frameworks and action with its 47 member States on the occasion of the first Council of Europe Conference of Ministers responsible for Media and New Communication Services (Reykjavik, 28 and 29 May 2009). It is expected that this Ministerial Conference will identify areas for international law development in the form of Council of Europe conventions.

In this context, it is recommended that such cooperation be enhanced to ensure that freedom of expression and access to information via the Internet is not compromised by private ownership and management of the Internet's critical resources. Equally important is the need to establish policy on the next steps/strategy for ICANN following its release from the Joint Project Agreement, under which it is tasked to comply with a series of "responsibilities" deemed necessary for its release from official oversight of the Government of the United States of America.

Enhanced cooperation for State and non-State actors to work together at the global level through the Internet Governance Forum

Enhanced cooperation with and through the Internet Governance Forum on public policy issues pertaining to the Internet has helped the Council of Europe to formulate new standards and tools to protect and promote human rights, democracy and the rule of law on the Internet. This has been achieved through greater multi-stakeholder dialogue with State and non-State actors.

The Internet Governance Forum has, over the past two years, inspired the Council of Europe's conceptualization of more than seven Committee of Ministers recommendations in the media and information society field and two sets of human rights guidelines for key non-State Internet actors, namely online games providers and European Internet service providers. Important issues such as public participation in Internet governance, gender equality, youth participation and regard for people with disabilities on the Internet have also emerged and are stirring public policy in and through the Internet Governance Forum.

The Internet Governance Forum is effectively enhancing cooperation on public policy and has considerable value as a platform for global networking and cooperation. It is therefore recommended that the Forum be sustained and developed.

Enhanced cooperation for State and non-State actors to work together at the pan-European level through the EuroDIG process

At the pan-European level, the Council of Europe and other State and non-State actors have also come together in the Pan-European Dialogue on Internet Governance (EuroDIG: www.eurodig.org). EuroDIG provides a platform to discuss and shape European multi-stakeholder perspectives on Internet governance (i.e., universal access, security, privacy and openness on the Internet, critical Internet resources). Such "bottom-up" cooperation is mobilizing and motivating a range of actors at local, regional and national levels in Europe. It is fostering communities of practice which would not have otherwise existed and is complementing the "top-down" approach to public policy formulated by Governments. It is therefore recommended that regional "bottom-up" style initiatives, like EuroDIG, be supported and fostered as a catalyst for public policy; in this context, Governments, relevant intergovernmental organizations, international non-governmental organizations and representatives from civil society and the private sector should be encouraged to cooperate.

Internet Society

Recommendations

All stakeholders should take advantage of the opportunity to become more involved in Internet community organizations, which develop technical standards and discuss issues at the intersection of technology and policy. In that regard, in its Memorandum on the Future of the Internet in a Global Economy, addressed to OECD ministers at their meeting on the future of the Internet economy, held in June 2008, the Internet technical community formally invited Governments to join it in an open and collaborative community, together with business and civil society, to extend the benefits of creativity and convergence to all communities, in all parts of the world.

At present, few Governments, international organizations or civil society groups take advantage of the opportunities that are available to them. The Internet brings technology and policy together in unprecedented ways. New approaches, new venues and new forums have arisen to respond to the opportunities thus created. It is vital, in turn, for all stakeholders to take up this challenge by participating in these new forums, which are so critical to the responsible development of the Internet.

The United Nations should take steps, through its component organizations, to create awareness of the opportunities to engage with others in developing a holistic approach to Internet-related public policy principles. It should go even further by supporting capacity-building programmes to help Member States understand how best to become involved in relevant organizations, how and when they can contribute to discussions, and how to develop the expertise required to do so meaningfully. Support and encouragement from the United Nations could make local, regional and global forums concerned with Internet technology and policy and their intersection more dynamic and inclusive.

Governments and international institutions should make their Internet policy-related and decision-making activities more open and inclusive of all stakeholders.

ISOC points to the steps taken by the OECD to include the Internet technical community and civil society in their Internet-related policy work. The Internet Society welcomes these opportunities and suggests that the United Nations consider the OECD example as a case study for increasing openness in its own organizations, and for recommending mechanisms that Member States could implement locally and regionally.

Efforts to enhance cooperation in governmental, intergovernmental, non-governmental and international organizations must be founded on a commitment to openness, inclusiveness and outreach, so that the entities that may be affected by decisions are able to participate in the development and implementation of those decisions. This approach is obviously fundamental to the development of an Internet that itself will be open, inclusive and beneficial to people around the world. And yet ISOC has repeatedly observed that some organizations have not implemented mechanisms allowing all stakeholders to participate in discussions and debates, even when these are often specifically related to the management or deployment activities of non-government stakeholders, or to technical and operational matters that do not have an impact on international public policy issues. In particular, ISOC has found that opportunities to participate are most restricted when actual binding decisions

are being made; for example, at global assemblies and treaty-making conferences. ISOC further states that the debates preceding a decision should be made much more open to all stakeholders' contributions.

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development

Reference to the Seoul Declaration for the Future of the Internet Economy

OECD would like to highlight the outcomes of an OECD Ministerial Meeting on the Future of the Internet Economy (www.oecd.org/FutureInternet) held in Seoul, Republic of Korea, on 17 and 18 June 2008. The main outcome of the Ministerial Meeting was the adoption of the Seoul Declaration for the Future of the Internet Economy by 30 OECD member countries, as well as nine non-members and the European Community.

United Nations E/2009/93

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
11 June 2009

Original: English

Substantive session of 2009
Geneva, 6-31 July 2009
Item 2 (b) of the provisional agenda*
High-level segment: annual ministerial review

Letter dated 9 June 2009 from the Permanent Representative of Jamaica to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Economic and Social Council

Attached herewith is the national report of Jamaica on progress towards the achievement of the internationally agreed goals, including the Millennium Development Goals, for the annual ministerial review to be held during the high-level segment of the 2009 substantive session of the Economic and Social Council (see annex).

I should be grateful if you would circulate the present letter and its annex as a document of the Council, under item 2 (b) of the provisional agenda.

(*Signed*) Raymond O. **Wolfe**
Ambassador
Permanent Representative

* E/2009/100.

09-36746 (E) 010709

Please recycle

Annex to the letter dated 9 June 2009 from the Permanent Representative of Jamaica to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Economic and Social Council

National report of Jamaica on the Millennium Development Goals for the annual ministerial review of the Economic and Social Council

Contents

List of abbreviations and acronyms 4

Executive summary 6

Overview 8

Vision 2030 Jamaica - National Development Plan 10

MDG progress matrix for Jamaica 10

The Millennium Development Goal areas 13

Poverty and hunger (MDG 1) 13

Education (MDG 2) 15

The challenge of equity and quality 15

Education transformation 16

Child rights 17

Gender (MDG 3) 17

A focus on public health 19

Overview 19

Chronic non-communicable diseases, malignant neoplasms and injuries 20

Mental health 21

HIV/AIDS 21

Financing health care 22

Child survival (MDG 4) 23

Maternal health (MDG 5) 24

Combating HIV/AIDS, malaria and tuberculosis (MDG 6) 26

Environmental sustainability (MDG 7) 28
Sustainable development through policy coherence 30
Energy use 30
Water and sanitation 30
Urban housing conditions 31
Developing a global partnership for development (MDG 8) 32
Cross-cutting issues affecting the achievement of the MDGs 34
Global recession 34
Violence 34
Unattached youth 35
Conclusion and recommendations 36
Annex: Recommended new targets and indicators of the MDGs for Jamaica 40
References 41

List of abbreviations and acronyms

AIDS	: Acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
BCG	: Bacillus Calmette-Guérin
CAREC	: Caribbean Epidemiology Centre
CARICOM	: Caribbean Community
CDERA	: Caribbean Disaster Emergency Response Agency
CO_2	: Carbon dioxide
COSHOD	: Council for Human and Social Development
DPT	: Diphtheria
ECOSOC	: Economic and Social Council
EMS	: Environment management systems
EPI	: Environmental Performance Index
ESSJ	: Economic and Social Survey of Jamaica
FCF	: Forestry Conservation Fund
GDP	: Gross domestic product
GSAT	: Grade Six Achievement Test
HEART	: Human Employment and Resource Training
HIV	: Human immunodeficiency virus
ICT	: Information and communication technologies
IADB	: Inter-American Development Bank
JSIF	: Jamaica Social Investment Fund
LAMP	: Land Administration and Management Programme
MDG	: Millennium Development Goals
MOH	: Ministry of Health
NCDs	: Non-communicable lifestyle diseases
NGO	: Non-governmental organization
NHF	: National Health Fund

NIS	: National insurance scheme
NTA	: National Training Agency
ODA	: Official development assistance
OECD	: Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OPV	: Oral polio vaccine
PAHO	: Pan American Health Organization
PATH	: Programme of Advancement Through Health and Education
PIOJ	: Planning Institute of Jamaica
PHC	: Primary health care
SEA	: Strategic environmental assessment
SID	: Small island developing State
STIs	: Sexually Transmitted Infections
TB	: Tuberculosis
TV	: Television
UN	: United Nations
UNESCO	: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFPA	: United Nations Population Fund
UNICEF	: United Nations Children's Fund
UNIFEM	: United Nations Development Fund for Woman
USA	: United States of America
VEN	: Vital, essential and necessary
VPA	: Violence Prevention Alliance
WHO	: World Health Organization

Executive summary

Jamaica has a population of almost 2.7 million and is a Caribbean small island developing state, ranked third among 75 countries as a natural disaster hotspot (World Bank 2005). It is a heavily indebted country. At 111.3% (2007) it has the fourth largest debt-to-GDP ratio in the world, with debt servicing consuming 56.5% of the 2009/10 budget. Remittances, tourism, and bauxite account for over 85% of foreign exchange. Coupled with reliance on imports, particularly oil, food and consumer goods, this makes the economy acutely vulnerable to exogenous shocks, as evidenced by the initial impact of the global economic crisis. Inflation is up, remittances are down, tourism is stable but heavily discounted, and returns from bauxite are predicted to be only 30% of last year's (2008) figures. Major bauxite plants are closed for at least a year, there are 1,850 job losses and 850 staff are on a three-day week. According to Labour Force Reports, there were 14,750 job losses in other sectors from October 2008 to May 2009. This is in the context of a decline in ODA due to Jamaica's middle income categorization.

The country has made good progress in eight out of the 14 MDG targets for 2015. Jamaica has already achieved the targeted reduction in absolute poverty, malnutrition, hunger and universal primary enrolment and is on track for combating HIV/AIDS, halting and reversing the incidence of malaria and tuberculosis, access to reproductive health, and provision of safe drinking water and basic sanitation. Lagging in gender equality and environmental sustainability, it is far behind in child and maternal mortality targets. Of great concern is the significant slippage in the proportion of the urban population living in unacceptable living conditions or slums.

Jamaica's overall health status is good. It has a good health record in primary health care, and can share several best practices. It needs financing at affordable, concessionary rates to stimulate renewal of the primary care model and other support, including partnerships with educational institutions to build capacity and expand the training of health personnel. Many migrate to developed countries leaving Jamaica with chronic staff shortages in some areas.

Homicidal violence, 77% by the gun, is a leading social problem; it is male on male, youth on youth, poor on poor.[1] Of the youth, aged 15-24, 26.2% males and 7.9% females are illiterate. Unattached youth, those who are not in school, unemployed and not participating in any training course, comprise roughly 30% of the total youth population. About a quarter of unattached youths had attained only a grade 9 level or less of education.[2] This makes female youth vulnerable to sexual exploitation and adolescent pregnancy and puts male youth in an extremely vulnerable position, which might lead to participation in criminal gangs.

[1] *Economic and Social Survey Jamaica, 2008* (Kingston: Planning Institute of Jamaica, 2009).

[2] Jamaica Adult Literacy Survey, 1999.

Unemployment has declined from 15% in 1990 to 10.6% in 2008. This decrease is partly due to the growth of the informal sector from an estimated 28% of GDP in 1989 to an estimated 43% in 2001, probably one of the several contributors to a significant reduction in poverty levels.[3]

Unless there are mitigating actions, global recession will negatively impact the achievements in poverty reduction, since these have been based on controlled inflation, growth of the informal sector to over 40% of the economy, and growth in remittances. Violence and the numbers of vulnerable youth are likely to increase and together these factors will cause slippage in MDG progress. Under global partnership developed countries need to continue and, where possible, increase support to the development process through aid, debt forgiveness, debt equity swaps, technology transfer, support for regional and global partnerships, joint ventures and structured arrangements between donor and recipient countries to ensure benefits from migration.

[3] Ibid., selected years; also, *The Informal Sector in Jamaica* (Inter-American Development Bank (IADB), 2002).

Overview

Jamaica is a middle income small island developing state (SID) in the Caribbean region, ranked by the United Nations in the medium human development category. Its population is near 2.7 million with a GDP per capita of US$4,816.7 at the end of 2007. Annual population growth is 0.4% and life expectancy 74.1 years. The country has a long tradition of stable two-party democracy. A recently reformed electoral system ensures elections free of corruption through, among other things, electronic voting.

Endowed with natural assets, Jamaica has arable land, outstanding scenic beauty, high levels of biodiversity, white sand beaches and modest mineral resources. These provided for much of the early income growth generated from a vibrant tourist industry, sugar, bananas and significant bauxite mining. Today the sugar and banana industries are in decline, partly due to the ending of trade preferences. Jamaica's tourist industry has strengthened and is of a high standard, attracting 2.9 million visitors a year. Its bauxite industry has, until recently, been expanding. Overall, unemployment has declined from 15% in 1990 to 10.6% in 2008. This decrease is partly due to the growth of the informal sector from an estimated 28% of GDP in 1989 to an estimated 43% in 2001,[4] probably one of the several contributors to a significant reduction in poverty levels.

For the past 40 years, however, there have been prolonged periods of low economic growth, large fiscal deficits, and weak export performance. Real gross domestic product grew by only 0.8% per annum from 1973 to 2007, although in the last decade it has been 1.3%.[5] Remittances from the Jamaican Diaspora have been escalating, and are now the country's leading source of foreign exchange totaling over US$2B in 2008. The country is heavily indebted and with a debt-to-GDP ratio of 111.3% (2007) has the fourth highest ratio in the world. In the latest 2009/10 budget, debt servicing (56.5%) and wages and salaries for civil servants (22.5%) left very limited fiscal space for development priorities such as infrastructure and social programmes. Education received 12.6%, national security 8.2% and health 5.3%. It is important to note that the debt includes the sum absorbed by the Jamaican government in the wake of the financial sector crisis of 1995-96, amounting to 44% of GDP. Most of the resultant debt is held by local creditors, and was 53.7% of total debt in January 2009. Since the crisis, more stringent monitoring and regulation of the financial sector has been introduced.

The global recession is now having a significant impact on the economy. Falling demand for alumina on the world market has resulted in the closure of major bauxite operations for at least one year, resulting in 1,850 job losses, another 850 jobs taking a 40% salary cut from a shorter work week, and a predicted 70% decline in bauxite revenues for the next financial year. There were 14,750 job losses from other sectors

[4] *The Informal Sector in Jamaica.*

[5] Vision 2030 Jamaica - National Development Plan.

between October 2008 and May 2009.[6] From November 2008 to February 2009, remittances, which have been increasing every year for a decade, were down by 21%. Up to the end of February 2009 tourist arrivals had continued to increase but earnings were down due to heavy discounting. Arrivals and average expenditure per visitor are expected to decline in the future. Inflation is increasing: the Jamaican dollar devalued against the US$ by 22% from September 2008 to mid-February 2009. The social impact of the crisis has not yet been documented, but already property crimes are reported by the police to be increasing markedly island wide.[7]

Remittances, tourism, and bauxite together account for over 85% of Jamaica's foreign exchange. Coupled with a reliance on imports particularly oil, food and consumer goods, this makes the Jamaican economy acutely vulnerable to exogenous shocks as evidenced by the initial impact of the global economic crisis. Unless mitigated, these impacts will negatively affect MDG progress.

A great internal challenge facing Jamaica is homicidal violence with a murder rate at 60 per 100,000 persons in 2008. In this respect Jamaica is also part of a broader landscape: the highest interpersonal violence mortality rates worldwide are found in the Americas among males 15 to 29 years of age.[8] Despite its high murder rate Jamaica has remained an outstanding tourist destination because this violence has rarely been directed at non-Jamaicans. Its characteristics are male on male, poor on poor, and youth on youth. Half of those admitted to high security adult correctional centres for major crimes in 2007 were males between 17 and 30 years of age. The ratio of males to females who commit major crimes is 49:1.

Seventy-seven percent of murders in 2008 were committed using guns. Jamaica has become a trans-shipment point between the USA and South America and this gun trade has increased their availability, facilitated by drug profits. The cost of crime and violence is undoubtedly a factor in Jamaica's stagnant growth. A World Bank Study conducted in 2002, found the cost of crime and violence in 2001 to be 3.7% of GDP.[9]

Jamaica is highly vulnerable to hurricanes, flooding, and earthquakes. In a 2005 World Bank ranking of natural disaster hotspots Jamaica ranked third among 75 countries with two or more hazards, with 95% of its total area at risk.[10] Between 2004 and 2008, five major events caused damage and losses estimated at US$1.2B. These have had significant impact on human welfare, economic activities, infrastructure, property

[6] Accumulative Redundancies Reported by Quarter, Ministry of Labour and Social Security.

[7] ESSJ, 2008.

[8] (World Health Organization, 2002) *Injury Chart Book* p. 61.

[9] http://info.worldbank.oreetools/docs/library/49114/jm_crime.pdf.

[10] World Bank, *Natural Disaster Hotspots: A Global Risk Analysis*. Disaster Risk Management Series #5 (World Bank, 2005).

losses and natural resources. Outbreaks of dengue and leptospirosis experienced in 2007 were largely influenced by weather conditions.

Vision 2030 Jamaica - National Development Plan

The Government of Jamaica, in collaboration with the private sector and civil society, has prepared a long term National Development Plan: Vision 2030 Jamaica. The Plan envisages Jamaica reaching developed country status by 2030. It introduces a new paradigm, redefining the strategic direction. The old paradigm for generating prosperity was focused on exploiting the lower forms of capital — sun, sea and sand tourism — and exporting sub-soil assets and basic agricultural commodities. These "basic factors" cannot create the levels of prosperity required for sustained economic and social development. The new route is the development of the country's higher forms of capital — the cultural, human, knowledge and institutional capital stocks — coupled with the reduction of inequality, which will move the society to higher stages of development.

MDG progress matrix for Jamaica

Goal Targets	Progress Dec 2007	Explanation	Comment
1. Eradicate Poverty & Hunger			Causal factors include reduction in inflation, growth of informal sector, increase in real wages, and probably include remittances. Vulnerable to exogenous shocks. **Likely to be unsustainable under global recession.**
1a. Halve, between 1990 & 2015, the proportion of people below the poverty line	**Achieved** (Table 1)	Reduced by two-thirds.	
1b. Halve, between 1990 & 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger	**Achieved** (Table 1)	Proportion of under weight children <5 yrs reduced by Three-quarters. Proportion of food poor reduced by two-thirds.	
2. Achieve Universal Primary Education			Problem not access but quality of education, under-performance of boys, & attendance problems connected with poverty.
2a. Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling	**Achieved** (Table 2)	Net enrolment over 90%. Gross enrolment almost 100%	
3. Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women		No gender disparity at primary level. Gender disparity begins at grade 6 in the primary completion rate and peaks at grade 9 of secondary levels as boys drop out. Males under-represented at tertiary level by 2:1. Low representation of women in Parliament **(13%)**	Problems include under-performance of boys, unemployment rate among women (over twice that of men), and cultural barriers affecting female participation in governance.
3a. Eliminate gender disparity in primary & secondary education, preferably by 2005, & to all levels of education no later than 2015	**Lagging** (Table 3)		

Goal Targets	Progress Dec 2007	Explanation	Comment
4. Reduce Child Mortality 4a. Reduce by two-thirds, between 1990 & 2015, the under-five mortality rate	**Far behind** (Table 4)	Under-five mortality rate only reduced by 14% up to 2005. Infant mortality rate reduced by almost one-third.	Immunization rates high. At Jamaica's comparatively low mortality levels major resources needed to reach target. 70% of infant deaths occur in perinatal period. There are unresolved data management problems in this area.
5. Improve maternal health 5a. Reduce by three-quarters, between 1990 & 2015, the maternal mortality rate 5b. Achieve by 2015, universal access to reproductive health	**Far behind** (Table 5) **On track** (Table 5)	Unresolved data management problems also exist in this area. Data available indicate a 20% reduction over 14 yrs Close to universal access to ante-natal care. Only 10% unmet need for family planning.	Deaths from direct causes halved over 10 yrs, but 83% increase in deaths from indirect causes e.g., HIV/AIDS, NCDs, unsafe abortions. 47% shortage in midwife cadre, lost to migration. Reproductive issue among young girls is forced sex.
6. Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases 6a. Have halted by 2015 & begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS 6b. Achieve, by 2010, universal access to treatment for HIV/AIDS for all those who need it 6c. Have halted by 2015 & begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases	**On track** (Table 6) **On track** (Table 6) **On track** (Table 6)	1st decline in AIDS deaths in 2005 and in AIDS cases in 2006. Access to retroviral drugs jumped from <5% in 2000 to 60% in 2008. Local malaria outbreaks since 2006 swiftly contained, no deaths. TB incidence/deaths	Major reason for decline was access to antiretroviral treatment through Global Fund. Malaria had been eliminated for many years but there were 186 imported cases in 2006, followed by local transmission in 2007. Poor sanitation in urban inner-city areas now cited for more recent local outbreaks in Kingston.

Goal Targets	Progress Dec 2007	Explanation	Comment
7. Ensure Environmental Sustainability 7a. Integrate principles of sustainable development into country policies & programmes & reverse the losses of environmental resources 7b. Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant reduction in the rate of loss 7d. Halve by 2015 the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation (Table 7) 7d. By 2020 have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers	**Lagging** **Lagging** (Table 7) **On track** (Table 7) **Slipping back** (Table 7)	Policy coherence & long-term sustainable development planning has been lacking. Achieved elimination of ozone depleting substances; inadequate progress in protected areas; slippage in reduction of CO2 emissions. 92% have access to safe drinking water, while 98.9% have access to basic sanitation. UN data suggests slippage. Insufficient data collected nationally.	National Development Plan is important step towards policy coherence/ long-term integrated sustainable development. Reliance on, high use, and inefficient production of oil-based energy a major problem. Identified as a priority policy focus. Environmental data collection mechanisms a challenge. Access to water has improved but challenge is sanitation issues e.g., management of solid waste and poor hygiene. Urban population has grown from 35% in 1991 to current 52%. Poor infrastructure a major problem. 1 000 units recently completed in public inner-city housing programme with social interventions. Social Investment Fund has new inner-city infrastructure projects.

Jamaica is making good progress in eight out of the 14 targets for 2015. The achievements are in reduction of absolute poverty, reduction of malnutrition and hunger, and achievement of universal primary education. While not devaluing these achievements, the analysis that follows indicates that for poverty the achievement may be fragile and for education Jamaica has a problem with quality.

In those targets where Jamaica is on track — combating HIV/AIDS, halting and reversing the incidence of diseases such as malaria and tuberculosis, access to reproductive health, and provision of safe drinking water and basic sanitation — gains are more solid, despite remaining challenges.

The areas in which Jamaica lags—gender equality and environmental sustainability — reveal some interesting and important lessons. For gender they include male under-performance in education and the enigma of a higher rate of unemployment for women, despite their educational gains. To get on track with environmental sustainability will require dealing with inefficient energy production and oil dependency, improving

protection of biodiversity and habitat, especially coastal areas and, critically, achieving policy coherence so that sector policies are not working at cross purposes.

Where Jamaica is far behind, in targets for child and maternal mortality, it is recognized that this is partly because Jamaica already has comparatively low mortality rates and further gains are mainly dependent on increased financial, technological and human resources.

The greatest concern is around the area of slippage: the proportion of the urban population living in unacceptable living conditions or slums. It is noted that monitoring is inadequate as the annual national household survey does not measure this, relying instead on United Nations agencies for information on slippage. The implications in this area can negatively impact all the MDGs.

The Millennium Development Goal areas[11]

Poverty and hunger (MDG 1)

TABLE 1 - GOAL 1: Eradicate Poverty and Hunger				
Targets	**Indicators *(source)***	**1990**	**2000**	**2007**
1a.	1.1 Proportion of population living below the national poverty line	28.4%	18.7%	9.9%
	1.4 Status of poorest (and wealthiest) quintiles in national consumption	6% (46%)	6.7% (46.1%)	6.8% (45%)
	(Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions)			
1b.	1.9 Prevalence of underweight children under 5 yrs of age	8.4%	5.1%	2.2%
	1.10 Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption (the food poor)	8.3%	4.9%	2.9%
	(Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions)			

Despite minimal economic growth (Table 1), Jamaica has experienced a rapid decline in poverty as measured by a consumption indicator. A key question is how much these data represent a substantial movement out of poverty and how much is merely a movement of the transient poor just above the poverty line?[12] Certainly, real mean per capita consumption has increased since 1990.

A number of factors are thought to have led to the poverty rate reduction, such as, government fiscal policy which has prioritized and successfully reduced inflation and

[11] Data on targets and indicators for all MDG areas are based on availability and national relevance.

[12] One credible estimate based on the annual household *Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions* is that one-third of households move in and out of poverty repeatedly (Handa. S. 2008) *Moving on up?* "The dynamics of poverty in Jamaica". Powerpoint presentation to 2008 Planning Institute of Jamaica, Jamaica Survey of Living Condition Conference).

the growth of the informal sector. The phenomenal growth in remittances is also likely to have reduced poverty.[13] Indicators of under nutrition reveal good progress for children and the general population, but obesity is an emerging problem. Despite the achievement of the poverty target, the level of inequality has not moved. Moreover, because poor households often include many children they are unequally impacted by poverty, with 22% of children living below the poverty line.[14]

In 1996, the Government instituted a National Poverty Eradication Policy and Programme. This encompassed *inter alia* rural electrification, micro-finance, and a Social Investment Fund that has greatly assisted early childhood institutions, social services, water and sanitation projects, rural feeder roads, inner-city infrastructure as well as community organizational capacity building.

In order to improve the coherence, efficiency and targeting of social assistance, in 2002, Government introduced a Social Safety Net Reform Programme and established a conditional cash transfer Programme of Advancement Through Health and Education (PATH), rationalizing and merging the income transfer components of three former programmes, significantly reducing leakage. Children are the main beneficiaries but PATH also covers the elderly poor, other destitute poor, persons with disabilities and pregnant and lactating mothers. An interim assessment carried out in 2006[15] suggested that PATH had slightly improved school attendance and significantly improved by 38% health clinic visits for children 0-6 years. PATH' s overall impact on poverty has not yet been assessed. PATH now targets 360,000 beneficiaries, up from 236,000 in 2006. By December 2008, 85% of this number had been registered.[16] A Steps-to-Work programme to support poor households in seeking and retaining employment is now being piloted. From 2002 to 2007 approximately US$120M has been spent on PATH, including a US$40M World Bank loan.

Poverty rates are highest in the rural areas (15.3% in 2007, compared with 6.2% in the Kingston Metropolitan Region and 4% in Other Towns[17]) and have shown the slowest rate of decline over time. One method of facilitating economic empowerment in rural areas is through the provision of security of land tenure because lack of registered titles, a critical form of collateral, is a major factor impeding the development of the rural economy. The Land Administration and Management Programme (LAMP), a comprehensive attempt by the Government of Jamaica to title unregistered lands, is being gradually rolled out across the country and to date is in almost half the parishes.

---

[13] Vision 2030 Jamaica-National Development Plan, (Planning Institute of Jamaica, 2009).

[14] *Economic and Social Survey Jamaica, 2008 (ESSJ)* Planning Institute of Jamaica.

[15] D. Levy, *Findings from Impact Evaluation of Jamaica's PATH Programme.* (Mathematica Policy Inc. for Ministry of Labour and Social Security, July 2006).

[16] *ESSJ, 2008.*

[17] *Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions 2007* (Planning Institute of Jamaica, 2008).

Development in the rural areas also needs to involve diversification of economic activities, and the upgrading of social and economic infrastructure.

Education (MDG 2)

TABLE 2 - GOAL 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education				
Target	**Indicators *(source)***	**1990**	**2000**	**2007**
2a.	2.1 Net Enrolment Rates in Primary Education	n/a	93.8%	90.2%
	2.2 Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5 in primary (penultimate grade) *(Ministry of Education)*	n/a	88.3% 92.61M84.1	94.2% F97.6/M91
	2.3 Literacy rate of 15-24 yr olds *(1999 Min. of Education, 2007 UNESCO Inst. for Stats)*		91.6% (1999)	94.3%

Access to primary education has been achieved with almost 100% net enrolment at the early childhood level and 90% at primary level. The country has yet to meet the target of universal education at the secondary level where enrolment is 86% in the first three grades (7-9) but only 63% in grades 10 and 11, indicative of inadequate completion rates. Gross enrolment at tertiary level is 31%. Tuition is free at primary but not at early childhood level except in the few public infant schools (6% coverage).The Government instituted free tuition at secondary level in 2007 and has set 2016 as the target date for universal enrolment at this level. Fees in tertiary level institutions are subsidized and a government student loan scheme is available.

Complementing the education system is an effective training system, the Human Employment and Resource Training-National Training Agency (HEART/NTA) Trust, regarded as the standard bearer for the Caribbean and other developing countries.

The challenge of equity and quality

Jamaica's challenge is equity, the provision of quality education for all children. The society has been burdened with the vestiges of an inequitable two tier education system. As a result the quality of education at different schools has varied widely. The differences in performance are explanatory: in 2007 in the external Grade Six Achievement Test (GSAT), which decides selection to the upper or lower tier at secondary level, the average score in Language Arts for government primary schools (attended by over 90% of students) was 48% compared with 72% for private preparatory schools; the respective average scores for Mathematics were 46% and 70%. In 2006, at the end of secondary school, passes from the eligible cohort in upgraded public high schools (attended by 66% of students) in external Caribbean-wide English Language exams were 11% compared with 62% from the upper tier of traditional public high schools. The respective results for Mathematics were 4% and 41%.[18]

[18] *Jamaica 2015: National Progress Report 2004-2006 on Jamaica's Social Policy Goals* (Jamaica Social Policy Evaluation, a Project of the Cabinet Office, 2008).

These latter results, which compare poorly with other CARICOM countries, also highlight the generally poor outcomes of the secondary school system, a serious impediment in the preparation of young people for tertiary level education, for the job market and generally for economic and social development. Currently 74% of the labour force has neither certification nor training.[19] These poor outcomes are borne out by the negative experience of tertiary level academic institutions and employers and suggest that the overall youth literacy rate can be a deceptive MDG 2 indicator for countries at the medium level of development. Functional literacy rates would give a more realistic and meaningful picture, since basic literacy is not appropriate for their job markets.

Education transformation

In October 2003, a unanimous Parliamentary Resolution was passed to incrementally increase the budgetary allocation to the Ministry of Education (MOE) to 15% of the total within five years. This has not yet been achieved and stood at 12.6% in the 2009/10 Budget due to fiscal constraints. A Task Force on Educational Reform was established, with a wide remit. Consultations with citizens and experts throughout the country led to a report which analysed the inequities and major problems in the system and provided clear recommendations, including the significant expenditures needed to transform the education system. These included an injection of approximately US$630 million in capital and recurrent expenditure in the first two years. Thereafter, the annual recurrent budget of US$491 million should be increased to US$770 million and total capital expenditure from 2005 to 2014 should total US$1.1 billion. To initiate the transformation an additional US$73 million was added to the education budget in 2006/07.

Under the Education Transformation Programme, areas of focus include:

- Expansion of school facilities and infrastructure
- School leadership and management
- Literacy and numeracy at the end of primary school
- Poor attendance
- Low levels of teaching resources and aids
- Violence and anti-social behaviour
- Low levels of teacher training at early childhood level

[19] *Labour Force Statistics 2007* (Statistical Institute of Jamaica).

Child rights

The Government recognizes the importance of early childhood (0-8 years) development for successful education outcomes. An Early Childhood Commission was established and an Early Childhood Act passed with standards set for early childhood facilities. A major project is now being implemented with World Bank support to implement the new thrust for comprehensive provisioning to meet early childhood requirements. This focus is also seen as one of the critical long term answers to the problem of violence in the society, since research has firmly established that patterns of violence and aggressive behaviour in adolescents and adults can be traced to behavioural and social problems in early childhood.

These and other initiatives are in keeping with Government's commitment to the Convention on the Rights of the Child. For example, the Child Care and Protection Act was passed in 2004, which strengthens the care and protection of children by introducing new standards for their treatment. An important provision of the Act makes not just the state but every citizen accountable—responsible for reporting if they know or suspect incidents of child abuse and punishable by law if they do not comply. Under the Act, the Office of the Children's Advocate (2005) was established to promote the safety, best interests and well-being of all children under 18 years, and to enforce their rights by investigating complaints and acting in legal matters on their behalf. Additionally, the Children's Registry (2008) was set up to facilitate the mandatory reporting of abuse.

Gender (MDG 3)

TABLE 3 - GOAL 3: Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women

Target	Indicators *(source)*		1990	2000	2007
3a.	3.1 Ratios of girls to boys in:	primary education	0.99	0.96	0.96
		secondary education	1.07	1.03	1.02
		tertiary education	1.26 (est.)	2.06	1.98
	(Ministry of Education)				
	3.2. Ratio of literate females to males 15-24 years old			1.1	1.07
	(1999 MM. of Education, 2007 UNESCO Inst. for Stats)			(1999)	
	3.3 Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural secto.		38.3%	37%	48.9%
	(Statistical Institute of Jamaica)				
	3.4 Proportion of seats held by women in the national parliament		5%	12%	13%
	(Electoral Office)				

Overall, Jamaica's MDG gender record shows an uneven picture. Despite the long record of active political party membership, women have low levels of political power

and leadership. Levels of representation in the Senate (14%) and in local government (16%) are slightly better than in Parliament (13%).[20]

Women's unemployment rate is more than twice that of men (14.5% cf. 6.2% for men in 2007), despite the fact that they outnumber men 2:1 in tertiary education.[21] This is partly due to a greater number of unskilled jobs available for men. Nevertheless some Jamaican women have made substantial gains in the labour market where a few occupy visible positions of leadership—Leader of the Opposition, Chief Justice, Director of Public Prosecutions, Financial Secretary, Auditor-General and Chief Medical Officer, and women account for 54% of Permanent Secretaries in Ministries. Some head prominent, successful businesses and have been elected to lead national private sector manufacturing and employers' groups. Young women have found increasing employment in the services sector, particularly in call centres and data processing services and in an expanding tourist sector, while there has been decreasing female employment in agriculture due to the decline in the sugar and banana industries. Empowerment fails in areas of violence against women where domestic violence and sexual violence continue to be significant.

The gender gap in education begins to appear in the primary completion rate which is 97.6% for girls and 91% for boys. Women have a higher literacy rate than men (91.1% to 80.5% in 2007)[22] and girls outperform boys at every level of the education system. Research shows that socialization in the home along rigid gender stereotypical lines produces different educational outcomes for girls and boys. For boys, male privileging prevails whereby boys are given less tasks and responsibilities and allowed to go outside with limited supervision, whereas girls are given domestic chores and kept inside. Such patterns are manifested in the education system whereby girls are more prepared to handle routine and responsibility than boys.[23] Additionally, the notion of the male as primary economic provider and male perceptions of the irrelevance of the education system to existing labour market opportunities (including the informal economy and illegal activity) also push young men into earning at an early age. Within the school system causes are thought to include pedagogy, the traditional bias towards academic subjects and the social stigma still attached to skills training geared to boys, and the gender bias of some teachers exhibited in more punitive measures towards boys.[24]

[20] National Gender Task Force, 'Sector Plan for Vision 2030' (PIOJ).

[21] Ibid.

[22] UNESCO Institute for Statistics.

[23] Odette Parry, *Male Underachievement in High School Education in Jamaica, Barbados and St. Vincent and the Grenadines*, (2000); Barbara Bailey, "Gender and Education in Jamaica: What About the Boys?", *Education for All in the Caribbean: Assessment 2006* (UNESCO monograph series).

[24] Ibid.

A focus on public health

Overview

Jamaica ranks high among developing countries in the health status of its population, the result of well developed primary health care (PHC) infrastructure which reaches deep into rural areas, based on a policy decision taken in 1977 prior to the Alma Ata Meeting. The country has a record of providing good health at a low cost. Jamaica and the rest of the Caribbean was the first region in the world to eradicate poliomyelitis and measles. The continuing strength of the public health system was demonstrated at the end of 2006 during an outbreak of malaria, which was swiftly and successfully managed. Malaria was long eliminated but was imported by a refugee influx. It resulted in 191 cases but no deaths (Table 6). At the same time, while it performed well in this emergency, the primary health care system is threatened by staff shortages, as well as by lack of equipment in some health centres. The system is severely short of public health nurses and midwives, at 53% and 54% of the cadre, respectively with an annual attrition rate of 15%, as well as of pharmacists and community health aides. Registered nurses are 74% of the cadre.[25]

THE HEALTH TEAM

The primary health system recognizes the health team as important to service delivery. The health policy states that *"No highly trained person should spend time routinely doing tasks that could be undertaken by a lesser trained person."* Hence new cadres of health workers such as the Community Health Aide (CHA), Nurse Practitioners, Psychiatric Aid, Pharmacy and Lab Technical Assistants, Peer Educators, Contact Investigators, Behaviour Change Communication Agents, Psychologists as well as social workers have been introduced. **This is considered a best practice.** The innovation of CHAs has served to bring health closer to the community and has contributed to Jamaica achieving its health status. CHAs provide health education, monitor the elderly, facilitate immunization, and have been pivotal in nutrition education and other interventions.

The Ministry of Health (MOH) is now preparing a framework for a renewed primary health care strategy and has earmarked funding for the first phase. This framework is necessary to promote sustainability, quality and cost effectiveness against the background of a changing health landscape where migration of the health workforce is a major challenge, and disparities exist in training, medical education and distribution of human resources. The four key strategic areas of the renewed PHC model focus on strengthening leadership, the information system, health financing and human resources.

PHC in Jamaica has contributed to meeting the Millennium Development Goals. It has been responsible for high levels of immunization and an antenatal care programme which includes high risk antenatal care and ensures that over 98% of mothers have at least one antenatal visit and over 87% have four (Table 5). More than 90% of women attending antenatal clinics are now

[25] Ministry of Health, *Strategic Framework for Safe Motherhood within Family Health Programme 2007-2011* (April 2007).

tested for HIV. With the introduction of antiretroviral treatment the mother to child transmission rate was brought below 10% by 2007.

Family planning programmes under the National Family Planning Board have been very successful in reducing the fertility rate from 4.5 children per woman of child-bearing age in 1975 to the present 2.5. United Nations agencies such as PAHO, UNICEF and UNFPA have provided critical support in health areas related to women and children, the latest being the joint Safe Motherhood Programme.

Chronic non-communicable diseases, malignant neoplasms and injuries

The epidemiological transition is advanced here with chronic non-communicable lifestyle diseases (NCDs), malignant neoplasms, violence, and intentional and unintentional injuries responsible for most deaths. This profile mirrors that of developed countries. Over the period, 2000-2008, the prevalence of diabetes increased to 7.9% from 7.2%, of hypertension to 25.2% from 20.9, and of obesity to 25.3% from 19.7%.[26] The Government has developed a National Policy and Strategic Plan for the Promotion of Healthy Lifestyles to tackle the increasing prevalence of these NCDs along with cervical and prostate cancer, and the prevention of violence-related injuries, the last now a significant and very costly public health problem. This policy will be achieved by focusing on preventable behavioural risk factors which for chronic disease includes physical activity, appropriate eating prevention and control of smoking. While the country has made significant gains, the challenge is to find culturally effective interventions that will lead to positive behaviour change.

PROVISION OF SUBSIDIZED DRUGS

A recent success of the health system has been the provision of subsidized drugs through the National Health Fund (NHF) established in 2003, and sustainably financed through an excise tax on tobacco and by the National Insurance (NIS) Fund. The NHF was created to provide institutional financial support to the public health system, including resources for PH emergencies (e.g. hurricanes, dengue 'threat'), prevention of NCDs, infrastructure development and institutional benefits. It provides drugs for 15 medical conditions with a small flat dispensing fee (US45 cents) for the elderly and a subsidy of over 80% for the rest of the population (Table 8). These drugs from the VEN (vital, essential and necessary) list cover both generic and non-generic. Private pharmacies, skeptical at first, have now bought into the system with the great majority involved. It has an electronic health record system with 400 000 chronic disease patients across the country.

Dealing with intentional and unintentional injuries has resulted in reallocation of staff, shortage of blood supplies and disruption in scheduled operations. An analysis of the economic costs of injuries due to interpersonal violence in Jamaica in 2006 assessed the

[26] R. Wilks, N. Younger, M. Tulloch-Reid, S. McFarlane, D. Francis, *Jamaica Health and Lifestyle Survey 2007-2008* (Epidemiology Research Unit, University of the West Indies and the National Health Fund, Dec 2008).

direct medical costs (approximately US$31.8M) to account for about 12% of the country's total health expenditure, while indirect costs (approximately US$416M) account for about 4% of GDP.[27] Jamaica's health profile also reflects this major national problem. Overall, homicide is the fifth leading cause of death in Jamaica. The four leading causes of death for men are cancer, homicides, heart disease and cerebrovascular diseases; for women they are cancer, cerebrovascular diseases, diabetes and heart disease.

Mental health

Twenty-six per cent of women and 15% of men suffer from depression.[28] Government has undertaken a process of decentralization of mental health services to provide accessible, comprehensive, community-based mental health services, including island wide child guidance clinics. A framework and work-plans for this decentralization have been developed, and resources are urgently needed for implementation.

HIV/AIDS

It is estimated that, as of 2007, 25,000 persons, or approximately 1.3% of the adult population, are HIV infected and that almost two-thirds of this group are unaware of their status. The last three to four years have also seen the first decline in AIDS deaths and AIDS cases by 38% and 30% respectively.[29] This is due to: (i) the increase in access to antiretroviral drugs from less than 5% in 2000 to 60% in 2008 (Table 6), provided free of charge to public sector patients and at greatly reduced prices for private patients through the NHF with Global Fund assistance; (ii) prophylaxis against opportunistic infections; and (iii) improved laboratory capacity to conduct investigations, resulting in a general improved quality of care.

It is also the aim of MOH's dynamic multi-faceted programme to combat the AIDS epidemic, recognizing it to be a development concern as well as a health issue. This has included:

- policies to guide the management of HIV/AIDS within educational institutions, the workplace (increasingly implemented in the private and public sectors), and for orphans and other children made vulnerable by HiV/AIDS;

[27] E. Ward and A. Grant, "Estimating the economic costs of injuries due to interpersonal violence in Jamaica" In *Manual For Estimating the Economic Costs Of Injuries Due to Interpersonal and Self-Directed Violence (Geneva:* World Health Organization, 2008).

[28] Ibid.; R. Wilks, et al., *Jamaica Health.*

[29] *ESSJ 2007 and ESSJ 2008.*

- community outreach programmes, including outreach to sex workers;
- the Mother-to-Child Transmission programme; and
- effective behaviour change, communication and public education programmes, including street demonstrations of condom use and mass media advertisements.

HOSPITAL-BASED CHILD ABUSE MITIGATION PROJECT

From 2004 to 2008 an experimental Child Abuse Mitigation Project (CAMP) was set up in the national children's hospital for 0-12 year olds. It had three objectives:

1. To develop and implement a hospital-based model to identify and refer victims of violence

2. To improve parenting skills and conflict resolution

3. To develop and implement an intervention model within the child's environment (home, school, church) through interaction with existing community based programmes

A small staff of social workers and one psychologist investigated 1 284 cases (4 per 1,000) referred from the Accident and Emergency Department as suspected victims of physical abuse, sexual abuse or with gunshot wounds. Staff would investigate, visit homes, give immediate counseling and refer when necessary. Parent education sessions and attendance of selected clients at weekly and summer art, music and recreational camps to effect the building of life skills and create a healing space were included. Set up by the MOH in collaboration with UNICEF, **it was recently assessed as a best practice model, the only one of its kind in the English-speaking Caribbean**. It was successful in its first objective and partially in the others, due to human and financial constraints. There are plans to restart it and replicate it in other hospitals.

This work is supported by ongoing research: reproductive health surveys, knowledge, attitudes, behaviour and practice surveys, as well as specific topic and area focused studies.

Financing health care

Since May 2007, health care at the 340 public health clinics and the 23 public hospitals (excluding the university teaching hospital) has been free to all children under 18 years, and, since April 2008, to the general public, abolishing user fees introduced previously as a cost sharing measure. According to several rounds of an annual household survey, despite explicit exemption for the poor, this approach was impeding one in five persons from accessing health care.

Financing health service delivery is a major challenge as the current expanded demand on the resources, combined with the human resource constraints from migration of health personnel, can potentially overwhelm the primary care delivery process. Jamaica spends between 4 and 5.5% cent of the national budget on health care (the recommended proportion is 10-15%) and at the same time does not qualify for much donor funding as it falls in the lower middle income country category.

The NHF utilizes a creative model of taxation, "sin taxes", and is considered a health financing best practice. It could be replicated with items such as alcohol and selected junk foods, using that income to create institutional capacity to focus on prevention of

disease. Jamaica is currently exploring other health financing opportunities through public-private partnerships.

Child survival (MDG 4)

TABLE 4 - GOAL 4: Reduce Child Mortality				
Target	**Indicators *(source)***	**1990**	**2000**	**2007**
4a.	4.1 Under-five mortality rate	29.5/1,000 (1993)	25.4/1 000 (1998)	25.4/1 000 (2005)
	4.2 Infant mortality rate *(Statistical Institute of Jamaica)*	24.4/1,000	21.3/1 000 (1998)	21.3/1 000
	4.3 Proportion of 1-year-old children immunized against measles (immunized up to 23 months old)* *(Ministry of Health)*	74%	88.1%	87.2% (2006)

* *Jamaica was measles free until a 2008 contact of an imported case. Since then there have been no further reports. The measles vaccination is usually given between 12 and 23 months.*

Historically, Jamaica has had an outstanding record for immunization but in recent years coverage has dipped for BCG, OPV, and DPT from the 2002 high where all vaccine coverage rates exceeded 90%. Contributing to this problem are:

- a severe shortage of public health nurses and midwives in most parishes resulting in Immunization Clinics being compromised;
- schools accepting children without full immunization. This can be eliminated with improved inspection;
- insufficient Community Health Aides, who assist in monitoring immunization status and identifying and referring children not immunized, as well as educating parents and caregivers; and
- young parents who have never seen these preventable diseases and do not take their children for vaccination when they are otherwise well.

Financial and human resource constraints impact performance against the MDG targets for infant, child and maternal mortality in particular. There are unresolved data management issues with regards to measuring child and maternal mortality. Therefore, while estimates exist, their validity is uncertain.[30] Nevertheless, existing data indicate that the majority of infant deaths occur during the neonatal period. Reductions will require expanding neonatal care services and must take cognizance of the increasing

[30] Data discrepancies exist in both Infant Mortality and Maternal Mortality estimates. A Vital Statistics Commission has been established by the Government to ensure the production of estimates on vital statistics that meet international standards and, with support from international partners, measures are being put in place to address the data management issues.

disability rates that accompany survival of the very preterm infants, with plans made to provide support services to address the needs of these infants. The National Early Childhood Strategic Plan is expected to expand screening and service delivery to the 0-3 year population through public health clinics, targeting 30% of health centres in order so as to offer high quality well child services by 2011.

Maternal health (MDG 5)

TABLE 5 — GOAL 5: Improve Maternal Health

Targets	Indicators *(source)*	1990	2000	2007
5a.	5.1 Maternal mortality ratio	120/100 000	94.8/100 000	n. a.
	(McCaw-Binns et al. 2007 and Planning Institute of Jamaica)	(1986-87)	(2001)	
	5.2 Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel	95%		96.8%
	(Ministry of Health)	(est.)		(2006)
5b.	5.3 Current contraceptive use among women in union* (15-49 yrs old)		65.9% (1997)	69% (2002)
	5.4 Adolescent fertility (15-19 yrs)		112/1 000 (1997)	79/1 000 (2002)
	5.5 Antenatal care coverage:			
	at least one visit		99%	98.1% (2002)
	at least four visits		87.2% (both 1997)	n/a
	5.6 Unmet need for family planning (women 15-44 yrs)	16.1%	9.0 4%	8.5%
	(National Family Planning Board)	(1989)	(1997)	(2002)

* *in union = in a married, common-law or visiting relationship*

One critical factor slowing the rate of reduction in maternal mortality has been the impact of NCDs. While deaths from direct causes declined by 49% between 1987 and 2006 due to improved health management and improved access to obstetric care, over the corresponding, there was an 83% increase in deaths from indirect causes, negating these gains. The incidence of HIV/AIDS in the antenatal population has been a significant factor as well as morbidity from hypertension; heart disease (now the second leading cause of maternal death) and diabetes, often associated with obesity even in young mothers.

A factor affecting the monitoring of maternal mortality is the need for accurate and consistent measurement. To date, no data has been available since 2001 due to unresolved data management issues. However, based on available data, severe shortage in the cadre of midwives is another critical component. Maternal mortality rates will not be improved unless the resources are found to train and retain adequate numbers of midwives and manage the flow of nursing personnel to developed countries.

Reproductive health, adolescent sexual health, fertility and sexual knowledge, attitudes and practices are extremely important and impact on MDGs in health, education and poverty reduction.

The adolescent fertility rate is still very high, although from 1997 to 2002 it reduced significantly (Table 5). Twelve per cent of sexually active 15-19 year old females have had between two to three pregnancies. With respect to HIV/AIDS, adolescent females 10-14 years face twice the risk and those 15-19 years three times the risk of contracting the disease, due to transactional sex, forced sex and sex with older HIV infected male partners.

THE WOMEN'S CENTRE OF JAMAICA FOUNDATION

Given the correlation between maternal and child health and the education of women improvements in the educational system should have a positive impact on this goal in the long-te m. In the cause of the continuing education of adolescent mothers, the Woman's Centre of Jamaica Foundation, with seven centres across the island, operates a very successful programme, educating them when they leave school during pregnancy, training them to care for their babies immediately after birth, and assisting them to re-enter the formal school system to complete their education. The young fathers (this is the usual pattern) and the families of both parents are included in the centres' outreach. Starting as an NGO and now under the Ministry of Youth, Sport and Culture, they have assisted over 35 000 teenage mothers since 1978. Tracer studies have demonstrated their success in halting the mother to daughter cycle of adolescent pregnancies.

Influencing sexual decision-making among youth has become extremely important, not only in relation to STIs and early pregnancy but also from a human rights perspective of personal choice and control. Pre-teen and teenage girls are a vulnerable group. Many are not sufficiently empowered to resist male advances or to insist on safe sex practices. In a recent school- based survey of 10-15 year olds,[31] of the 6% of girls who reported they had had sexual intercourse, an alarming quarter stated they had been forced. In a parallel community-based survey of 15-19 year olds,[32] 48% had had sexual intercourse and one in five reported being forced.

[31] K. Fox, and G. Gordon-Straughan. *Jamaica Youth Risk and Resiliency Behaviour Survey 2005.* (USAID/MEASURE Evaluation/Ministry of Health, Mar 2007).

[32] R.Wilks, N. Younger, S. McFarlane, D. Francis, and J. Van Den Broeck. *Jamaica Youth Risk and Resiliency Behaviour Survey 2006.* (University of the West Indies/USAID/MEASURE/Min. of Health, Nov 2007).

Combating HIV/AIDS, malaria and tuberculosis (MDG 6)

The primary mode of transmission of HIV infection is through heterosexual sex (71%). The main reported risk factors for HIV/AIDS infection in Jamaica are multiple sex partners (around 80%), a history of STIs (51%), sex with sex workers (24%), men who have sex with men (14%), and crack/cocaine use (8%).[33]

Despite progress there is still much further to go in terms of the effective education of young people and the pursuit of the struggle against stigma and discrimination, which have proven to by some of the strongest obstacles in the battle against the HIV/AIDS epidemic.

Vector control to prevent the re-emergence of previously controlled communicable diseases has emerged as a new challenge. Better management of garbage and improved hygiene has become increasingly important. Since November 2006, Jamaica has been affected by a two malaria outbreaks with confirmed local transmission leading to a cumulative total of 386 cases by the end of September 2008. The MOH has brought the situation under control through intensified surveillance, public awareness and health education, strengthened laboratory capacity, improved vector control, early detection and case management. The increased workload to control the outbreak has placed additional strain on limited health resources. A National Malaria Control Strategic Plan is due in May 2009. There is also a National TB Control Strategic Plan focused on increasing access to TB diagnostic and treatment services across the island, which will be finalized by June 2009.

[33] Ministry of Health, National HIV/STI Programme. *Jamaica HIV/AIDS Epidemic Update Jan – Dec 2007.*

TABLE 6 - GOAL 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases				
Targets	**Indicators *(source)***	**1990**	**2000**	**2008**
6a.	6.1 HIV prevalence among population aged 15-24 yrs		1.4% (est.)	1.3% (est. 2007)
	6.2 Condom use at last high-risk sex*: men		77.3%	83.5%
	(age 15-24 years) women		71.7%	66.3%
	6.3 Proportion of population aged 15-24 yrs with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS: men		29.6%	37.4%
	women		33.4%	42.3%
	6.4 No. of children orphaned by AIDS *(Ministry of Health)*			8 000 (est.) (1986-2007)
6b.	6.5 Proportion of population with advanced HIV infection with access to antiretroviral drugs *(Ministry of Health)*		<5% (est.)	60%
6c.	6.6 Incidence of malaria (imported prior to 2006)	0	7	191
	Deaths associated with malaria	0	0	0
	6.9 Incidence of tuberculosis	123	120 (2003)	98 (2006)
	Deaths associated with tuberculosis	n/a	24 (2003)	16 (2006)
	6.10 Proportion of tuberculosis cases detected & cured under directly observed treatment short course *(Ministry of Health)*	n/a	45 (2003)	77 (2006)

** Definition of high risk in 2000 (= partner < 12 months) differed from definition of high risk as of 2008 (non-marital, non-cohabiting partner) making comparison difficult.*

Environmental sustainability (MDG 7)

TABLE 7 - GOAL 7: Ensure Environmental Sustainability				
Targets	**Indicators *(source)***	**1990**	**2000**	**2007**
7b.	7.1 Proportion of land area covered by forest *(Forestry Department)*	30.6% (1989)	30.1% (1998)	30.6%
	7.2 CO_2 emissions: total (000 metric tonnes)	7 963.16	10 396.91	10 591.88 (2004)
	per capita (metric tonnes)	3.36	3.98	3.97 (2004)
	7.3 Consumption of all ozone depleting substances (ODP metric tonnes) *(UN MDG website)*	431	69.5	2.5 (2006)
	7.4 Proportion of fish stocks within safe biological limits *(Ministry of Agriculture)*	n/a	n/a	n/a
	7.5 Proportion of total water resources used (total reliable yield) *(Water Resources Authority)*	22.36%	35.19%	38.3%
	7.6a Proportion of terrestrial area protected in relation to total surface area	8.2% (est.)	n/a	n/a
	7.6b Proportion of marine area protected in relation to total territorial waters *(UN MDG website)*	0%	3.6% (est.)	3.6% (est.)
	7.7 Proportion of species (plants) threatened with extinction *(National Environmental Protection Agency)*	n/a	n/a	18.6% (2003)
7c.	7.8 Proportion of population using an improved drinking water source	**91.7%** (61.2%*)	**91.5%** (66.6%*)	**91.7%** (70.2%*)
	7.9 Proportion of population using an improved sanitation facility *(Planning Institute of Jamaica)*	**99.1%** (51.4%**)	**99.8%** (62.2%**)	**98.9%** (64.3%**)
7d.	7.10 Proportion of urban population living in slums*** *(UN MDG website)*	29.2% (est.)	35.7% (est. 2001)	60.2% (est. 2005)

N.B. The MDG definition of an improved drinking water source includes rainwater.

** Piped water at home (indoor or private outside).* ***Use of water closet (exclusive or shared).*

**** Estimation based on two components, water & sanitation for 1990 & 2001 (UNICEF/WHO). Three shelter components (water, sanitation & sufficient living) from MICS 2000 were used to estimate 2005 slum dwellers.*

Jamaica's developmental strategies have been heavily focused on fostering economic growth, using the private sector as the primary vehicle for undertaking the related economic activities of tourism, mining, agriculture and manufacturing. In the past, this has resulted in sectoral policies not effectively taking account of environmental

considerations and consequently causing degradation of the natural environment, while local authorities often ignored breaches of environmental regulations.

The island's score for ecosystem vitality in the 2008 Environmental Performance Index (EPI) is 71%, the regional score being 72%, and the comparative income group 69.4%. Overall, Jamaica ranked 54 out of 149 countries in the EPI. The weakest area for Jamaica was in the biodiversity and habitat category where the score was 35, compared with the regional score of 43.2 and the global comparative income group score of 48.6. The variations in the specific indicators and scores are telling: conservation risk (66.4%), effective conservation (28.6%), critical habitat (40%), and marine protected areas (5%).[34]

Beaches, wetlands and coral reefs, the irreplaceable breeding grounds for fish and marine life as well as protection against the impact of hurricanes, are threatened by land-based pollution and natural factors such as global warming. Thirty per cent of mangrove forests have been lost and the Centre for Marine Sciences of the University of the West Indies' monitoring of coral reefs indicates that whereas nine reefs on the north coast had coral cover averaging 52% at 10 metre depth in the late 1970s, in 2005 the cover was between 0% and 34%. The reefs of the north western coast are under severe pressure from high levels of nutrients, including critical concentrations of nitrogen and phosphorus, discharged into coastal and fresh water sources by tourism related developments, human settlements, and excessive fertilizer use from farms.[35]

SELECTION OF POLICIES AND PROGRAMMES SUPPORTING ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY

- **Policy interventions for funding**: Support to environmental management by NGOs using debt-for-nature swaps for the establishment and operation of the Environmental Foundation of Jamaica and the Forestry Conservation Fund (FCF).
- **Co-managing natural resources.** Developing community-based income generation projects in sustainable use of forestry reserves co-managed by an NGO, Jamaica Conservation Development Trust.
- **Effective management of protected areas as well as new priority sites** identified in the ecological gap assessment: the target is 20% of Jamaica's marine and terrestrial area by 2015 (made at the 9th Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity)
- **Establishment of fish sanctuaries**
- **Target for moving renewable energy from the current 5% to 15% of the energy mix by 2020.** The introduction of cheaper E10 fuel, a blend of 10% ethanol from sugarcane and 90% gasoline, enthusiastically taken up by drivers.
- **Investment in a wind energy farm**, the Wigton Wind Farm, a Clean Development Mechanism project under the Kyoto Protocol, by the government-owned Petroleum Corporation of Jamaica.
- **Co-generation Power Project,** started by GOJ, which aims to produce and utilise petroleum coke (petcoke), a low cost clean coal technology, to generate electricity.
- **An Environment Management Systems (FMS) policy,** now at draft stage, for further standardization of, and compliance with, sustainable development initiatives, such as the use of solar energy in the tourism sector.
- **A draft Climate Change Action Plan** is being developed from Jamaica's 2nd National Communication on Climate Change.

The multiple indicators under this goal (Table 7) demonstrate its broad reach. Jamaica's rich environmental resources are treasures that make an immeasurable contribution to the quality of life of all its citizens. Reversing biodiversity loss is, nevertheless, very challenging in the short term for Jamaica as a SID state that is dependent on its rich environmental resources for the development of its two largest foreign exchange earners (excluding remittances), tourism and bauxite.

---

[34] *Vision 2030 Jamaica - National Development Plan* (Planning Institute of Jamaica, 2009).

[35] Ibid.

Additionally, even where we have the regulatory legislative framework, we have serious enforcement capacity gaps.

New directions, diversifying sources of wealth and being more environmentally friendly in approach, would include greater investment in sports, cultural and fashion industries; in the development, use and export of environmental technologies; in nutraceuticals and medicinal products from the rich plant life; and more agro-processing of high quality agricultural products for niche markets.

Sustainable development through policy coherence

There is a lack of integration of principles of sustainable development into policies and programmes. Failure will erode the quality of life in the medium to long-term, including prospects of economic prosperity. Strategic environmental assessment (SEA) of policies and programmes is one means of addressing policy coherence. It is also essential to design a coordinating mechanism dedicated to monitoring sustainable development.

Energy use

Because of its 90% dependency on oil for energy, Jamaica's CO2 emissions are rising on an annual basis (Table 7). Jamaica has one of the highest energy intensity rates in Latin America and the Caribbean. This has been due largely to the high-energy use of the bauxite and alumina and water sectors. Additionally, an inefficient public electricity system and inefficient outdated energy technologies put Jamaica at a competitive disadvantage. Diversification of energy sources represents a priority for the future development of the energy sector.

Water and sanitation

Water and sanitation indicators appear to be unchanging because of the difficulty in halving the gap when since 1990 access to safe drinking water has been over 91% and to basic sanitation over 99% (Table 7).

With regard to water, there is a significant difference between the rural areas, with only 86% of households accessing safe drinking water, and Other Towns and the Kingston Metropolitan Area with 95% and 97% access respectively. Quality improvement in water access, with a target of 85% receiving piped water to their dwelling by 2015, has been a focus. Over the period, the proportion of the population with piped water to their dwelling has increased to 70%. Improved water sources is a critical target for the 9% without safe drinking water and improved access is important for the 1.5% of households whose members have to carry water for distances of 50 to over 1,000 metres. The majority are women and children. The remaining gap in this area is being addressed by the Ministry of Water and Housing's Rural Water Supply agency, which harnesses small streams, rivers, and springs to supply isolated communities. It

also organizes public trucking of water. The promotion of private sector partnership has resulted in eight licences being issued to private companies to supply potable water.

With regard to basic sanitation quality improvement, enabling universal access to water closets has been a focus, and over the period the proportion of the population with water closets has increased by 13 percentage points to 64%. Increased attention is now being paid to upgrading sewage plants, cleaning drains and improving garbage collection in order to combat pests, improve vector control and to mitigate damage from natural disasters.

Urban housing conditions

The slippage that has occurred in the target of improving slums is of great concern. Jamaica's urban population has grown to 52% of total population in 2001[36] from 35% in 1991. Much of this growth is the result of rural-urban migration and in some areas, especially in the two major cities and transport corridors, has resulted in overcrowding, the growth of squatter communities and increasing stress on infrastructure and amenities unable to cope with the pressures of unplanned growth. Poor physical planning in the past has resulted in a myriad of problems evidenced by run-down town centres, urban sprawl, environmental degradation, unsafe and dilapidated housing, and planned and unplanned development in ecologically-sensitive areas. These problems are at their most acute in urban slums where high rates of malaria, dengue and leptospirosis were found in recent outbreaks. Infrastructural change, income-generating opportunities and social interventions are all needed simultaneously to reduce the high rates of interpersonal and gang violence associated with these communities.

The Jamaica Social Investment Fund (JSIF) has targeted 12 inner-city communities, employing 350 residents in infrastructure upgrading. These residents also receive on-the-job training certification from HEART/NTA.

An Inner City Housing Programme, by the National Housing Trust, including skills training and other capacity building programmes for prospective home owners, has built just over 1,000 units. However in 2008 the programme ended due to delinquent beneficiaries and other challenges, a serious blow to this effort. The problems include a culture of dependency in inner-city areas associated with a history of political patronage, and highlight the difficulties of this process and the need for a transformational approach. Alternative methods, requiring a more labour intensive construction process to employ inner-city dwellers may be needed. Planning and design phases may need to incorporate more citizen participation, like JSIF, which employs, trains and certify beneficiaries in the building phase. Mortgage payments would begin through wage deductions.

[36] *Population Census: Jamaica 2001* (Statistical Institute of Jamaica).

Although 81% of the population has secure housing tenure via ownership, rental or lease, a preliminary survey by the Ministry of Housing has found that almost a quarter of Jamaica's population are living as squatters on land they neither own nor lease, even though many own their dwelling. The Government has recently set up a squatter regularization unit and the Housing Agency of Jamaica, responsible for the provision of housing solutions, has started 600 lots in a very large squatter settlement on the outskirts of Montego Bay, Jamaica's second city

Developing a global partnership for development (MDG 8)

Jamaica's eligibility to access certain grant programmes has been reduced because of its categorization as a middle-income country and the geopolitical shift of resources towards the Middle East and sub-Saharan Africa. In addition, the areas of official development assistance have shifted away from preferential arrangements to trading relationships. The volume of grant funding from Multilateral Technical Cooperation agencies and some traditional bilateral donors has decreased, but loan financing has remained fairly stable. Assistance from several non-traditional bilateral partners has also increased and Jamaica has been successful in securing assistance from these and from multilateral sources.

On the demand side, Jamaica's capacity to absorb loans has been retarded by its already high debt burden and the consequent limit in fiscal space for social expenditure. While there have been constraints, the Government is seeking to ensure development objectives are advanced through more efficient portfolio management. As the country seeks to better manage its resources, development partners have assisted the Government through various types of disbursement (including budgetary support, and quick disbursing loans).

TABLE 8 - GOAL 8: Develop a Global Partnership for Development				
Targets	**Indicators *(source)***	**1990**	**2000**	**2007**
8a.	8.5 ODA received in Small Island Developing States in million US$ (net*) *(OECD)*	US$270.62M	US$9.98M	US$27.87M
	8.12 Debt service as a percentage of exports of goods and services and net income *(Planning Institute of Jamaica)*		10.47%	12.43%
8b.	8.13 Proportion of population with access to affordable essential drugs on a sustainable basis *(Ministry of Health)*	n.a	n.a	n.a
8c.	8.14 Telephone lines per 100 population	4.46/100	19/100	12.96/100 (2008)
	8.15 Cellular subscribers per 100 population *(Office of Utilities Regulation/ Statistical Inst)*	0/100	14.13/100	100.9/100 (2008)
	8.16 Internet users per 100 population *(International Telecommunications Union)*	0/100	3.08/100	55.3/100 (2008)

**Loans plus grants minus repayments.*

The relationship between Jamaica and the Bretton Woods Institutions has matured over time. These institutions are providing an increasing level of budget support with conditionalities based on the country's own reform agenda. Nevertheless, the ability of Jamaica and other developing countries to negotiate more equitable terms and conditions is significantly limited.

Jamaica has also been highly successful in negotiating mutually beneficial arrangements with international telecommunication companies to bring affordable cellular technology to Jamaica, with penetration of over 100%, tangibly raising the quality of life across all classes (Table 8). The focus on the use of ICT within the educational system, as well as its wide use in the public and private sector, has resulted in a rapid increase in access over the past eight years with over half the population now having some level of internet access.

Through the NHF, Jamaica is providing universal access to subsidized VEN drugs for 15 chronic medical conditions and, with the valuable assistance of the Global Fund, free antiretroviral drugs.

Cross-cutting issues affecting the achievement of MDGs

Three issues of critical importance in relation to Jamaica's achievement of the MDGs are: the global recession, violence, and the plight of unattached youth.

Global recession

Given the early impact of the global recession on remittances, job losses and inflation, the poverty reduction rate is almost certainly not sustainable and is likely to regress. Food security will be very difficult, particularly for children and the elderly, as present importation of food (about 40% of consumption) costs US$750 million. Hunger will negatively impact school attendance, educational performance and health targets. Increased poverty is likely to have an impact on crime. It is also likely to lead to increased squatting as job losses impact on ability to pay rent and to increased deforestation,as more persons not only turn to using wood for domestic cooking but to burning charcoal as a highly marketable commodity.

The Government has put new emphasis on agriculture and fisheries and this sector is one of the few, other than education, with an increased allocation in real terms in the tightly constrained 2009/2010 budget. Increasing food production will be critical and more schools must engage in this where they have land. School feeding programmes will need to be strengthened in this and other ways.

Violence

In 2008, 1,618 persons were murdered, 77% of them died by the gun, including 165 women and 94 children. There were 2,232 cases of sexual violence, 57% of the victims were under 19 years old. The majority of the victims were female, while 29 males were also violated.[37]

All forms of violent conflict impact nearly every MDG. It causes poverty from this slowdown and closure of businesses, immobility, injury or death of a household head and the impact on remaining family members. Its aggregate impact on GDP has already been illustrated. Gender-based

SELECTED COMMUNITY SAFETY & SECURITY INITIATIVES

- The Peace Management Initiative (PMI), set up in 2002 by the Ministry of National Security (MNS),Includes representatives of both political parties and civil society, defuses explosions of community violence, follows with development initiatives and counseling.
- The Violence Prevention Alliance (VPA), set up in 2004 by the MOH. Has pioneered the use of GIS software to generate 'injury hotspots'. This is a best practice use of evidence manipulating datasets from different ministries (e.g., incidence of violence-related injuries, sanitation, levels of literacy) correlated across communities to provide critical insights for policy making and police operations.
- The Citizen Security and Justice Programme and the Community Security Initiative, two MNS programmes, address social development and security services in poor communities, sometimes with the assistance of contracted NGOs.

[37] *ESSJ, 2008.*

violence is profoundly disempowering for women's well-being and their levels of economic productivity. Violence affects education as schools have to close down or attendance is negatively affected. Trauma affects educational performance, mental and physical health and productivity. Violence eats into resources needed to reduce child and maternal mortality and other areas in health care.

Research has assessed injuries caused by violence to have consumed about 12% of the country's total health expenditure in 2006.[38] Jamaica has adopted a multi-faceted approach to tackling violence. This approach includes peace and conflict resolution in schools and communities, mediation, restorative justice, and victim-centred mechanisms. At a structural level, both the Police Force and the entire justice system are undergoing radical modernization and reform.

Unattached youth

Jamaica's working-age population (15-64 years) was estimated at 63.4% of the population in 2007 and is expected to peak at 67% in 2025. This "bulge" in the population of working age is regarded by demographers as a "window of opportunity". Youth are the group that should see the fulfilment of the Vision 2030 Jamaica-National Development Plan. It is therefore critical that their capacity is built. In light of their unrealized potential and their vulnerability, unattached youth are a particular concern. These are individuals aged 15-24 years who are not in school, unemployed, and not participating in any training course. This group accounts for roughly 30% of all youth.[39] About a quarter of unattached youths had attained only a grade 9 level or less of education. Of this age group, 26.2% males and 7.9% females are illiterate.[40] This makes female youth vulnerable to sexual exploitation and violence, and adolescent pregnancy and puts male youth in an extremely vulnerable position leading to participation in criminal gangs.

For development to be achieved, it is now understood that social infrastructure needs to be strengthened simultaneously with physical infrastructure development. This social development has to start with good parenting practices and early childhood education, and the ongoing building of resilience through promotion of healthy lifestyles, extra-curricular activities, after-school homework assistance, weekend and summer children and youth programmes, family life education, skills training, capacity building in conflict resolution, mediation and organizational skills.

---

[38] E. Ward, and A. Grant. "Estimating the economic costs of injuries due to interpersonal violence in Jamaica" in *Manual for estimating the economic costs of injuries due to interpersonal and self-directed violence* (Geneva: World Health Organization, 2008).

[39] *ESSJ, 2008*.

[40] Jamaica Adult Literacy Survey, 1999.

Conclusion and recommendations

The immediate external challenge preventing Jamaica from making greater headway in the MDGs is its heavy debt burden. When the country spends so much on debt repayment, it is virtually impossible to make significant headway in tackling problems of educational transformation, youth vulnerability and urban decay. Improvement in these areas could have a significant impact on violence reduction, on economic growth and achievement of MDG targets. In addition the costs of improving environmental conservation and disaster mitigation, now more urgent in the face of climate change, cannot be ignored. With the added pressure of recession, deterioration in all of these areas seems inevitable. If this is to be prevented and if successful and critical interventions are to be maintained, let alone scaled up, more development aid is needed. Lessons from Jamaica's successes can help less developed countries; regression in its development would threaten the entire Caribbean region.

It is important that when countries move into the middle income category, their developmental progress is not threatened by a reduction in aid but the level of aid is sustained until the gains are consolidated. Otherwise it can appear as if countries are being penalized for doing well. In Jamaica's case, the criteria for funding and assistance do not recognize violence as vulnerability, in terms of the way in which high levels of violence thwart achievement in the MDG indicators. The criterion of middle income status does not seem to take into account Jamaica's reality: the level of violence, its fragile status as a SID, and its economic vulnerability.

Developed countries therefore need to ensure that the development process is supported by:

- Aid; and
- Other equally important mechanisms such as:
    - debt forgiveness;
    - debt equity swaps;
    - technology transfer;
    - support for regional and global partnerships and joint ventures – very small islands will always have limited capacity and these partnerships are essential;
    - foreign direct investment which promotes the development of domestic capital;
    - support for infrastructural development;

- support for anti-corruption initiatives; and importantly
- structured arrangements between donor and recipient countries to ensure benefits from migration – this applies particularly to health and education professionals.

With specific reference to the health sector the following is recommended:

- Policy support from the international community to ensure equitable access to health through improving capacity to finance the health sector;
- Financing at affordable, concessionary rates to stimulate renewal of primary care model;
- Partnerships with educational institutions to build capacity—expand training of health personnel;
- E-health: application of information technology to health
  - Health insurance
  - E-pharmacy
  - Tele-mentoring
  - E-radiology; and
- Capacity development to mobilize resources (human, economic, technical).

United Nations agencies have provided tremendous assistance to Jamaica. This assistance works best when the following issues are taken into account:

- *Country ownership of policies and programmes*. Effective contributions to public policy require a genuine willingness to listen to the input of developing country stakeholders and local experts and to take cognizance of cultural contexts for the most effective outcomes. There can be challenges when agencies wish to influence policy based on the experience of external consultants.
- *Policy directives from international gatherings do not come with economic support*. It creates challenges for countries to implement such directives. This is the case with some of the health MDGs, e.g., infant and maternal mortality.
- *Partnerships build national and regional capacity*. An example of this is the Caribbean Epidemiological Centre, which combined PAHO posts and national posts. It reported to PAHO but reflected Caribbean aspirations. The United Nations empowered the Caribbean Disaster Emergency Response Agency of CARICOM

when it agreed that CDERA did not need to go through the United Nations structure to raise funds, enabling it to keep the 18% administrative fees that formerly went to the United Nations. CDERA now approaches multilateral and other funders directly.

- *Projects are designed from the outset to lead to programmes*. This enables sustainability and ownership and builds local institutional capacity and reduces long-term external dependency. The success of United Nations agencies' strategic interventions needs to be an important part of their performance assessment, not just the level of funding disbursed.

- *A coherent harmonized sector-wide approach among United Nations agencies and multilateral agencies*. This will exponentially improve aid effectiveness.

Assistance that is enmeshed in layers of bureaucratic procedures is an obstacle to empowering the development processes in developing countries. The National Workshop feedback emphasized concerns with the bureaucracy of many international donors and suggested that a reduction in gatekeepers through greater use of technology could help.

Finally, Jamaica also wishes to make recommendations on the MDGs targets and indicators. These are intended to contribute to the discussions on the revision of the MDGs and to highlight actions to be taken in relation to policies and programmes. Some of these recommendations reflect earlier regional decisions within CARICOM and speak to goals and targets that are specific to Jamaica and other countries in the Caribbean region[41] (see annex for further detail).

It is suggested that universal access to early childhood education under MDG 2 be added as another target. Relating to that same goal, it is recommended that completion of secondary schooling also be considered as a target and that rates of illiteracy and functional literacy be added as indicators with special focus in 15-24 age group.

Violence is an impediment to the achievement of almost all other MDGs and therefore it is considered a discreet category, deserving of a target and related indicators that could monitor prevalence by age, sex and type of crime. Such a target would address the reduction of violence in all forms, including gender-based violence and gang violence. This target and recommended indicators could be added to Goal 3, gender equality and empowerment.

---

[41] See *Caribbean Specific Targets & Indicators* (CARICOM Secretariat, September 2005). The Twelfth Meeting of the Council for Human and Social Development (COHSOD) (27-29 April, 2005) considered the MDGs in the current Caribbean socio-economic context and urged the identification of Caribbean specific indicators. In following up the COHSOD recommendations, the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM), in collaboration with the CARICOM Secretariat, convened a meeting of its Task Force on Gender and Poverty in May 2005 to identify Caribbean specific gender indicators for the MDGs. The outcome of this taskforce was the document, *Caribbean Specific Targets & Indicators* which was submitted to CARICOM for presentation at the Millennium Development Summit in 2005.

As it relates to Goal 5, maternal mortality, reproductive health is undoubtedly tied to mortality yet not included as a distinct target. In this instance, it is recommended that a target be added to include the universal access to reproductive health. Related indicators could focus on monitoring the vulnerability of adolescents in this area. Chronic non-communicable diseases have been among the leading causes of death in Jamaica and in other parts of the developing world. Thus, this area could also have a target of its own, under Goal 6.

The impact of the global recession reminds us of how fragile humanity can be in the pursuit of economic prosperity. Therefore, the MDGs continue to provide United Nations member states with a vital integrated framework for looking at human and social development. In the context of the global recession, both its origin and consequences require concentrated focus on Goal No. 8, global partnerships, as the arrangements and commitments made in this area are now even more crucial for preventing slippage in the achievement of the goals. At the same time, distinctive socio-economic realities of member states, such as SIDs, indicate that the relevance of targets and indicators vary and in some cases, require specificity in approach. It is hoped that this forum with sharing of experiences on the MDGs will also provide countries with the opportunity for development cooperation and assistance towards global sustainable development that will effectively lift us out of the global recession.

Annex: Recommended new targets and indicators of the MDGs for Jamaica

Adapted from "Caribbean — specific targets and indicators", September 2005 CARICOM Secretariat All of the recommended amendments and new targets are in ***bold italics.***

GOALS & TARGETS	INDICATORS (new & amended)
Goal 1: Eradicate Poverty and Hunge.	
Amended Target: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people ***who fall below the poverty line***	○ Proportion of population ***living below the poverty line, by sex*** ○ Poverty gap ratio (incidence x depth of poverty), ***by sex*** ○ Share of poorest quintile in national consumption, ***by sex*** ○ Proportion of employed living in households with a household per capita income ***below the poverty line, by sex of head of household***
Goal 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education	
Amended Target: Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary ***and secondary*** schooling.	○ Net enrolment ratio in primary education, ***by sex*** ○ Percentage of pupils starting secondary level ***form*** 1 who reach ***form*** 5, ***by sex*** ○ ***Illiteracy*** rate of 15-24 year olds, ***by sex*** ○ ***Functional literacy rate of 15-24 year olds, by sex*** ○ ***Pass rates in CXC subject areas (English and Mathematics), by sex***
New Target: ***Ensure that, by 2015 pre-school age children have universal access to early childhood education.***	○ ***Net enrolment ratio in early childhood institutions, by sex***
Goal 3: Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women	
New Target: ***Reduce, by one-third, all forms of violence, including gender-based violence and gang violence by 2015***	○ ***Number of violence related injuries by age, sex and type of weapon*** ○ ***Crime rate by type of crime by age and sex of offender and age and sex of victim*** ○ ***Percentage of cases of sexual violence completed through the court process in a 12-month period from the date of charge***
Goal 5: Improve Maternal Mortality	
Universal access to reproductive and sexual health services through the primary health-care system by 2015.	○ Adolescent (10-19) fertility rate ○ Proportion of pregnant adolescents (10-19) who attended antenatal care clinics. ○ Proportion of women ***and men*** aged 15-49, contracting sexually transmitted infections by type
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other diseases	
New Target: ***Have halved by 2015 the incidence of chronic non-communicable diseases***	○ ***Prevalence of chronic non-communicable diseases by sex and age***

References

Bailey, B. (2006) "Gender and Education in Jamaica: What About the Boys?" In *Education for All in the Caribbean: Assessment 2006*. UNESCO Monograph Series.

Cabinet Office Jamaica (March 2008) *Jamaica 2015: National Progress Report on Jamaica's Social Policy Goals*. Kingston: Office of the Cabinet, Government of Jamaica.

CARICOM Secretariat (September 2005) "Caribbean Specific Targets & Indicators", CARICOM/UNIFEM Taskforce on Poverty and Gender. Guyana: CARICOM Secretariat.

Fox, K. and Gordon-Straughan, G. (March 2007) *Jamaica Youth Risk and Resiliency Behaviour Survey 2005*. Report for USAID/MEASURE Evaluation/Ministry of Health.

Group of Analysis for Development (GRADE) (Final Report November 2002) *Informal Sector Study for Jamaica*. Report for the Inter-American Development Bank.

Handa, S. (2008) *Moving on up? The dynamics of poverty in Jamaica*. PowerPoint presentation to 2008 Planning Institute of Jamaica Conference.

Levy, D. (July 2006) *Findings from Impact Evaluation of Jamaica's PATH Programme*. Mathematica Policy Inc. for Ministry of Labour and Social Security, Jamaica.

Ministry of Health - National HIV/STI Programme (2008) *Jamaica HIV/AIDS Epidemic Update Jan - Dec 2007*.

Ministry of Health (April 2007) *Strategic Framework for Safe Motherhood within the Family Health Programme 2007-2011*.

Ministry of Labour and Social Security (May 2009) *Accumulative Redundancies*. Quarterly Report.

National Gender Task Force (2007) *Sector Plan for Vision 2030*. Kingston: Planning Institute of Jamaica.

Parry, O. (2000) *Male Underachievement in High School Education in Jamaica, Barbados and St. Vincent and the Grenadines*. Barbados: Canoe Press, University of the West Indies.

Planning Institute of Jamaica (Draft November 2008) *Vision 2030 National Development Plan: Planning for a Secure and Prosperous Future*. Kingston: Planning Institute of Jamaica.

_____ (various editions from 1991-2008) *Economic and Social Survey Jamaica*. Kingston: Planning Institute of Jamaica.

_____ (various editions from 1990-2007) *Jamaica Survey of Living Conditions*. Kingston: Planning Institute of Jamaica and Statistical Institute of Jamaica.

Statistical Institute of Jamaica (2008) *The Labour Force 2007*. Kingston: Statistical Institute of Jamaica.

_____ (2002) *Population Census: Jamaica 2001*. Kingston: Statistical Institute of Jamaica.

_____ (1999) *Jamaica Adult Literary Survey*. Kingston: Statistical Institute of Jamaica.

Task Force on Educational Reform Jamaica (September 2004) *A Transformed Education System 2004*. Report (Revised Edition) presented to the Prime Minister, the Most Hon. P.J. Patterson.

Ward, E and Grant, A. (2008) "Estimating the economic costs of injuries due to interpersonal violence in Jamaica" in *Manual For Estimating the Economic Costs Of Injuries Due to Interpersonal and Self-Directed Violence*. Geneva: World Health Organization.

Wilks, R., Younger, N., Tulloch-Reid, M., McFarlane, S., Francis, D. (December 2008) *Jamaica Health and Lifestyle Survey 2007-2008*. Report for the Epidemiology Research Unit, University of the West Indies and the National Health Fund.

World Health Organization - Department of Injuries and Violence Prevention (2002) *The Injury Chart Book: A graphical overview of the global burden of injuries*. Geneva: World Health Organization.

World Bank (2005) *Natural Disaster Hotspots: A Global Risk Analysis*. Disaster Risk Management Series #5.

Wilks, R., Younger, N., McFarlane, S., Francis, D., Van Den Broeck, J., (November 2007) *Jamaica Youth Risk and Resiliency Behaviour Survey 2006*. Report for the University of the West Indies/USAID/MEASURE/Ministry of Health.